Catalonia the rebellious sister and Galicia the perfect child:
Why do we see different levels of secessionist movements across countries through regional identification?

By
Tiffany Deaton

Submitted to
Central European University
Nationalism Studies Program

In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts

Advisor: Professor Michael Miller

Budapest, Hungary
2015
Abstract

This thesis investigates the cause and effect of differing levels of nationalism across countries through regional identification. Through examining the discourse between regional and national identity. For this objective the historical autonomous regions of Catalonia and Galicia, Spain have been selected for a comparative study, with what constitutes Galician identity as the main objective. This is done by illustrating their different political and economic developments. Along, with relying on Critical Discourse Analysis to examine public opinion sections in Galician newspapers, and interviews in Ourense, Galicia. This research concludes that the to identify as Galician means to be of Celtic and Spanish culture. This duel culture creates less of a regional stronghold, equaling lower levels of secessionist movements.
Acknowledgments

I would hereby like to officially express my gratitude to Prof. Michael Miller for his patience, and assistance as a supervisor, as well as to other professors of the department. I cannot forget to also thank my classmates for the moral support, as we all needed some reassuring from time to time. Also, would like to express gratitude to Thomas Rooney of the Academic Writing Center, for his exceptional assistance over this past year. Lastly, my parents for their unconditional support during this stressful time.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ............................................................................................................................. ii

Acknowledgments ........................................................................................................... iii

1. Introduction .................................................................................................................. 1

2. Literature Review ....................................................................................................... 2
   2.1 Economic Development .......................................................................................... 2
   2.2 Political Development ........................................................................................... 5
   2.3 Secession and Self-Determination ................................................................ ...... 8
   2.4 Identity & Symbols ............................................................................................... 10

3. Historical Background: .............................................................................................. 14
   3.1 Pre-Unification ...................................................................................................... 15
   3.2 Early Twentieth-Century ...................................................................................... 19
   3.3 Franco Spain .......................................................................................................... 23
   3.4 Transition to Democracy ...................................................................................... 26
   3.5 Present Time .......................................................................................................... 29
   3.6 Center of Sociological Investigation, Spain ......................................................... 33
   3.7 Symbolism ............................................................................................................ 35

4. Methodology ................................................................................................................ 41
   4.1 Critical Discourse Analysis .................................................................................. 41
   4.2 Newspaper Analysis ............................................................................................. 44
   4.3 Interviews ............................................................................................................. 55
   4.4 Conclusion of Analysis ........................................................................................ 58

Final Conclusion ............................................................................................................. 59

Biblography ..................................................................................................................... 61
1. Introduction

This thesis will focus on nationalism through a regional lens in Spain. When one thinks of historical regions of Spain, the Basque Country and Catalonia are the most common. But, what about Galicia? In present literature there is a focus on secessionist movements in one part of a country, in comparison to the movements in a different country. Here, I want to explain why and how there are different levels of national and regional identities found within the same country.

Spain has seventeen autonomous regions, and three of those regions have special historical privileges: the Basque Country, Catalonia, and Galicia. My region of focus will be Galicia, Spain. Galicia has been widely overlooked as a possible secessionist region, even though Galicians share the title of historical autonomous region with Basque Country and Catalonia. There is a small-scale secessionist movement in Galicia in comparison to its autonomous region counterparts. Since there is such a difference in the levels of secession movements, I chose to conduct a comparison analysis. Through a comparative perspective I will be able to see where are the main differences that arise in the Galician secessionist movement from that of Catalonia’s secessionist movement. The reasoning for this comparison over Basque Country is that geographically Catalonia and Galicia are similar, and there have not been any violent revolts. By my examination of these two regions I want to demonstrate how national/regional identity can develop differently within the same country.
2. Literature Review

For the literature Review I will begin with covering economic development. As will be displayed in the section and following chapters the level of economic development varies greatly between Catalonia and Galicia. It is important to see why this occurred and it has affected each region’s identity. Secondly, I discuss relevant literature on political development. The economic and political developed are discussed to explain the connection between the economic level of a region and their political power. Following political development I cover secession and self-determination. From the political movements in Catalonia there has been a push for secessionism, but in Galicia such pushes are on much lower scales. So, the theory in this section will be to find an understanding for why that is. Lastly, I cover identity and symbols. This section ties in the first three covered areas, with examining how identity is constructed through political, and economic development. The ideology in this section will be reflected upon in the following chapters.

2.1 Economic Development

Spain is a relatively small county, but the levels of economic resources vary across regions. This comes from the fact that each region industrialized at different rates. In *Nationalism*, Gellner looks at the process of the emergence of nationalism through stages, and argues that nationalism materializes through identity formation and politics. His ideal of nationalism is a political principle, which maintains that the similarity of culture is the basic social bond. When a state becomes industrialized nationalism tendencies could surface. However, his principle does not necessarily

---

hold true for Catalans, who have held on to their nationalism since the unification of Spain in 1492. The Catalans, due to their ports, have maintained financial power; becoming industrialized only added to their economic capacities.

Reflecting Gellner’s ideology to Galicia, he argues the loss of agrarian society brings cultural differences to the forefront. With industrialization people move to urban areas, becoming intermingled into society; in contrast, in agrarian societies people tend to stay on the outskirts of the cities. As one can see in Galicia the village life still holds the large majority of the population, contrasting Catalonia were the population lives in urban centers. Those that are part of the agrarian society are more isolated. Those residing in these areas may still have access to news and knowledge about the things happening around them, but they simply do not have the necessity to become involved with them. The Galician economy is still strongly agrarian, but Galicians make it clear of their cultural differences to the center of Spain.

Through his analysis, Gellner concludes that nationalism is rooted in modernity. That id to say, an economic backing makes it easier to fund nationalism movements, but I believe it is not the key to it. He fails to discuss states, like Spain that may never industrialize to their full ability but still show signs of regionalism.

In Constructing the Nationalist State: Self-Sufficiency and Regeneration in the Early Franco Years, Richards is able to outline the identity of the Spanish nation under Franco. He explains that Franco viewed the peasantry as the embodiment of the national virtues; he saw their hardworking attitude and self-sacrifice as a goal

2 Ibid 32
3 Ibid. 36
for everyone of the nation to take on\textsuperscript{4}. (One could wonder if this was rooted in his Galician ancestry). Modesty and frugalness was made a positive national virtue through Franco’s propaganda. Additionally, Franco renewed the ties to the Catholic Church. Every Spanish citizen was to attend mass, sing patriotic songs every day, and learn the twenty-six points of the labor charter.

Galicia is an example of strong ties with the Catholic Church with the Camino of Santiago. Through this pilgrimage trail, Galicians have stayed close with the Catholic Church. (The trail and its importance will be discussed further in detail in the historical background chapter.) While in other regions of Spain, namely Catalonia they view the Catholic Church corrupt and of belonging to the bourgeoisie part of society.\textsuperscript{5}

Shifting more to Franco’s government policies of ‘purifying’ the nation. Franco saw Catalonia as having a ‘sickness’, which he treated with violence and repression tools by employing strong authority figures to control the region.\textsuperscript{6} By purification he wanted to disregard the political opposition. There were over 200,000 documented executions of opposition members under Franco’s government. Even with such a threat from Franco, Catalans had many underground organizations to keep their traditions alive. In contrast, Galicians were easily manipulated in Franco’s eyes and that kept the peace in the region.

Although, Richards’ chapter leaves several questions unanswered, which I


\textsuperscript{5} Ibid. 154

\textsuperscript{6} Ibid. 154
will focus on in a later chapter: From Franco’s repression, did Catalan Regionalism fester? From forcing the meetings to go underground and demanding more of an effort did Catalans then form more symbolic ties to Catalonia? Galicia had a separate language and culture than Franco’s ideal Spain, but did not experience repression on the same scale as Catalonia. A possible reason for less repression could be that Galicia was among the first to fall during the Civil War, whereas Catalonia put up a strong resistance. Additionally, with Galician’s strong peasant economy and Catholic ties Franco praised them. Was it the threat of Catalonia’s economic power and lack of faith that made Franco nervous? Therefore, knowing Galicia was weak economically; Franco did not feel threatened by their regionalism? These are key questions that will explain the fundamental differences between the two regions.

In the following section, I will cover the political developments within Spain and their effects on nationalism feeling.

**Political Development**

From Franco’s long lasting dictatorship the country had many stepping-stones to cover before returning to a functioning democracy. After his death the country encountered many problems returning to democracy. This section will focus on analysis on political community development, from Anderson’s *Imagined Communities*, to authors more focused on Spain specifically.

In his piece, Anderson discusses nations as part of an imagined community. He defines nationalism as cultural artifacts of a particular kind.\(^7\) These cultural

---

artifacts he refers to relate to the separate languages and customs that persist today from ancient times. Anderson, also claims a nation to be an imagined political community is both inherently limited and sovereign. Even though each member has this idea of unity, they will actually never know every person in their so-called nation. This source of nationalism comes from their feeling of cultural roots, and is strongly presented during regional holidays, when everyone celebrates together through community events, leading to a strong sense of togetherness.

From Anderson’s idea I raise several questions. While I understand there are separate imagined communities in Spain, what happens when an imagined community has enough solidarity to form a separate nation? Within Catalonia there is a strong push for a nation and unification of the past lands. A big part of their ideology is that even though they do not know each other, their Catalonia roots hold them together. On the other hand, Galicia has a sense of an imagined community, but why not as strong as Catalonia?

Moving to a concentration on Spain, I examine *Nations, States and Violence*, where David Laitin connects the past to the modern day struggle within Catalonia. He gives a brief history of the tense relationship with the center of the Spanish rule and the Catalonia region. Now, within the European Union Catalan speakers in France and Spain receive subsidies to promote the language in literature, primary education, and media. The Catalans in Spain see this as giving them the standing as a nation and not as a national minority in a state.

---

8 Ibid., p.4
In chapter four, *Nations and the Twenty-First Century State* Laitin explains what he labels the “game.” Laitin explains this “game” as a cost balance equation between assimilation into a new culture or preservation of a native culture. From governments and citizens this is largely played out when parents are deciding to emigrate and what language to have their children taught in. From this model he believes that the protection of national cultures and languages will remain stable in the wealthy countries of the non-English-speaking world. From Laitin’s formation Catalonia has the role as a wealthy region therefore granting support for the regional language. Meanwhile, following his ideology could why explain Galicia as one of the poorest regions of Spain having a larger emphasis on learning English than the regional language.

Here I continue with the role of language policies. In the chapter *Role of Language in Spanish State-Building*, Clare Mar-Molinero gives an overview of the previous literature including the work of Johann Gottfried Herder, whom she calls the father of cultural nationalism, for his analysis of comparative philology with a political outlook. She then breaks the discussion down into sections, looking at Catalonia and Galicia separately. Her conclusion touches on how issues of identity

---

10 Ibid. 105
11 He illustrates the “game” as an exchange between a government and a highly educated population, and for the purpose of an example he chose Norway. The government of Norway must to choose between English or Norwegian as the language of instruction. Then the Highly Educated Norwegian (HEN) has to choose between staying in Norway or emigrating to a country that pays the highest wages for their skills. There are five solutions to the game: 1. the government chooses Norwegian leading the HEN to remain; 2. the government chooses English and the HEN remains; 3. The HEN remains no matter what; 4. The HEN remains if the government chooses Norwegian but leaves if the government chooses English; 5. The HEN emigrates no matter what the government does.
12 Ibid. 105
has led to the protection of minorities in Spain, but the geographic limitations of regional languages, ensures Castilian as the national language. This creates what she calls a linguistic hierarchy.\textsuperscript{14} Later, I tie her analysis to what Latin mentioned earlier about the European Union, and Catalonia funding for Catalan. The question I keep in mind when testing the language dichotomy; what are the outcomes of funding in the regions; has Castilian continued to be in the backdrop or faded even further behind?

It seems from the political developments it’s important to move forward to the ideology of secession and self-determination.

**Secession and Self-Determination**

From the reinterpretation of the principle of self-determination of nations, after World War II secession has been viewed as the result of ethnic conflict and violence. But here, Horowitz argues that secession is almost never the answer to ethnic conflict and violence, but most likely makes the problem worse.\textsuperscript{15} Within these new secessionist states, a new minority will form leading to the same problem. States are reluctant to give more autonomy to regions out of the fear that it will lead to secession. Secession of one region will then disrupt the relationship with other regions, throwing a country off balance. Horowitz concludes with the idea of consociational democracy, this type of grand coalition for minority groups includes the following; can veto important policy issues, have ethnic proportionality in

\textsuperscript{14} Ibid., p.70
government positions, and obtain financial allocation for cultural autonomy. His new idea for democracy is already something we can see in Spain, with substantial regional autonomy in the three historic regions. Leading me to raise the question that, perhaps substantial regional autonomy feeds the secession movements.

On the other hand William Kymilica discusses how a country can approach the topic of diverse groups before it leads to secession movements. In his chapter titled “Multiculturalism”, he discusses how all-liberal democracies must deal with ethnic minorities, those of which he differentiates very clearly from immigrants who choose to uproot and come to a new country. These national minorities he refers to were once self-governing groups that have been adopted into a larger state. The larger governments can deal with them in one of three ways: grant some sort of autonomy, allow for Polytechnic rights, or give special representation rights. He does mention that allowing for one of these paths does not guarantee a group won’t push for autonomy. Furthermore, after mentioning the pros and cons of federalism, he does not fully endorse it. I think Federalism could be a more realistic option that he seems reluctant to explore. I expand his analysis to look at Spain having several ethnic minority factions, with my focus on Galicia and Catalonia

---

16 Ibid., 3
18 Ibid. p 5.
19 Ibid., p. 21
20 Ibid. p.12
Now, I am making the larger transition to what sets these two regions apart. By examining the development of each region's identity and symbols I can see where they differ from Madrid (the center) and from each other.

**Identity & Symbols**

Montserrat Guibernau has covered national identity quite extensively in *The Identity of Nations*. Her focus is primarily on the cases of Catalonia, Scotland, and Quebec. She defines national identity as: “a modern phenomenon of fluid and dynamic nature, one by means of which a community shares a particular set of beliefs that its members are ancestrally related”.  

I agree with her definition and will use it later in the analysis. She claims there are Five Dimensions to National Identity: psychological, cultural, historical, territorial, and political. 

Psychological covers the felt closeness of a group. Cultural is through the process of identification, which leads to emotional bonds among members of a given community. Historical is through antiquity displayed in the resilient selfhood of one’s nation. Territorial frames the shift towards a homeland, even if one has never been there. Lastly, the political dimension communicates the nation needing to replace religion as the source of legitimacy for rulers.

These five dimensions reflect a more updated version of the ethno symbolism national identity that Smith developed in his book *Nations and National Identity*. Guibernau’s dimensions were developed to reflect the development of national identity in the 21st century, as more nations are shifting towards more a secular stance, which is why I chose her ideology over Smith’s.

---

22 Ibid. p.13
23 Ibid. p.13
From Guibernau’s description of national identity I will compare and contrast Galicia and Catalonia. While under the same national flag they differ greatly on their stance on identity. More importantly, I will examine and reflect on how these autonomous regions developed their different regional/national identities.

Focusing more on the Catalonia case, Josep Llobera wants to explain this distinct Catalan National Identity. He asks, how could a region under repression for almost forty years come back so strong? He begins by explaining Pi-Sunyer’s three levels of ethno national affirmation: 1. Preservation on the family level, 2. Maintenance and transmission through social groups, 3. Underground political parties. 24 Moving on to historical memory, he analyzes how two important Catalan holidays portray Catalanism in different ways. The first holiday, September 11th, is National Day. While banned under Franco, it was bought back in 1977 as a platform for persevering identity and enhancing patriotism. The second holiday is April 23rd, St. George Day/Book day, when the Generalitat of Catalonia will send a book in Catalan and rose to other heads of state. 25 This holiday focuses more on a literary appreciation of Catalan and love of others. These holidays contrast greatly, but both bring out the unity of Catalans. He concludes that historical memory is the main component of ethno-national identity demonstrated by stateless nations.

From his ideal of historical memory in stateless nations, I reflect it also to times of conflict, specifically the Spanish Civil War. Galicia and Catalonia have different historical connections to the Civil war and I examine how their experiences

25 Ibid., p.184
are instilled in their memory. From here I make the larger transition to language identity.

Bernadette O’Rourke is a researcher focusing on the dichotomy between the Galician and Castilian languages. Her article gives some background on the success of the Galician language staying prevalent in society and everyday use. By being isolated from the rest of Spain, and still being a rural community, the preservation of Galician language has been achieved. But, as some of the population migrated they had to learn Castilian or their new host language, thus disregarding their mother tongue. She wanted to understand the paradoxical mismatch of supporting the learning of Galician, but then speaking mostly Castilian among the youth. 26 She conducted her research at the University of Vigo. The city of Vigo is one of the most sable economic cities in Galicia. The students she interviewed overwhelming stated that Gallego is an important part of Galician identity, and support an increase of Galician in society. Her research will be significant for my section on the formation of regional identity.

Another part of identity formation are the symbols allocated with it. In this last part of the section I will discuss the national and regional symbols and their developments over the years.

In “Remembering Banal Nationalism” Billig reminds us that symbols have two functions: to be remembered and to be forgotten.27 That is to say that there is a

---


parallel between ignoring and acknowledging a symbol. Like waves in the ocean, the processes have a natural ebb and flow. The retrieval and storage of these symbols in memory vary in speed and intensity. In addition, different scenarios can trigger these events. For these reasons, there is a variability in the way citizens react to nationalistic symbols.

The awakening process can be labeled as amnesia. Once a nation is established, its existence depends on a collective amnesia. While discussing amnesia Billig, connects this to Renan’s idea that amnesia ties the society and national identity together. The society of a nation stays connected as one unit through their common identification of a nation. This sense of community is important in the creation of a nation. The amnesia reminds the citizens that share a common symbolic history.

Through Bilig’s theory of Banal Nationalism, I will apply it to the regional levels in Galicia and Catalonia. Each region has different symbols, and different relations to their function. I explain how the symbolism has developed different levels of regionalism in Galicia and Catalonia.

**Following Chapters**

As I have now laid the foundation of theoretical background, the next chapter will cover the historical background for Galicia and Catalonia. An understanding of the historical differences are fundamental in understanding the discourse between each region and the central Spanish government. Through the historical

---

28 Ibid p.37
29 Ibid. p.39
background the key differences will be highlighted. Furthermore, this chapter will lay the foundation for the analysis chapter and the explanation of what it means to be Galician.

**Historical Background:**

To better understand the difference in levels of nationalism within Catalonia and Galicia, one must first understand what led people in these regions to those ideologies. The foundation of this analysis stems from their historical bases.
The historical groundwork for the autonomous regions of Catalonia and Galicia differ greatly ranging from their language formations to government structures. Here we have the case of two separate coastal regions with similar landscapes, and commonality of being separate nations at one time in history. This is where we see the common characteristics cease. As one nation their levels of nationalism to regain recognition as separate nations have varied greatly.

The years of focus are the early years of General Franco’s dictatorship, the early years of democracy after his death, and the present day. These points in time are important times for the Spanish state. By looking at the historical background one can see this is when the popular Catalon and Galician secession movements began to form and what caused them to gain momentum. From looking at policies at this time, I can examine where the differences surfaced between the two regions. The assumption is that governmental policies towards each region led them to have different levels of regionalism. I have a special focus on governmental policies effecting the protection of different cultural and language rights.

In this chapter, I will briefly cover their foundations as independent kingdoms, and then shift to the twentieth century, following life under Franco, the transition to democracy and to regaining autonomy, and ending with the time period 2005 to 2014. It is important to follow the changes and levels of repression each region endured to understand their different nationalist ideologies.

Pre-Unification

Map 1: Spain Pre-Unification
Map 2: Spain during unification year 1469

Source: http://www.nga.gov/content/dam/ngaweb/features/slideshows/the-art-of-power/power_map.jpg
Until 1410 Galicia was its own independent nation, after that point they were absorbed into the Kingdom of Asturias. Galicia was and still is proclaimed to be a Celtic Region of the Iberian Peninsula, as one of the seven Celtic nations. The name Galicia translates to the land of the Gaelic people, its regionalist anthem describing her as one of the ‘seven daughters of Breogan.’ (Breogan was the legendary ancestor of the Irish who sailed to Ireland from the Tower of Hercules in La Coruna, Galicia.) Their Celtic ties make it a unique region in Spain. Later in this chapter I will discuss the Celtic symbols still linked to Galician Celtic identity.

As discussed earlier Galicia has strong ties to the Catholic Church and that goes back to the ninth century, with the arrival of the cult of the Apostle James in Santiago de Compostela. This arrival gave Galicia a particular symbolic importance among Christians. The apostle St. James the Great is thought to be buried in Santiago de Compostela. The spiritual pilgrimage begins where the borders of France meets Spain, and continues to Santiago de Compostela where the Romans believed the world ended. The symbol of a shell shows the direction to the path for those taking the pilgrimage, and will prove to be important for Galicia’s identity in the centuries to follow. From being the most important religious sight on the peninsula the nobility of Galicia held an both advantage politically and militarily. The military had an heightened presence to protect the scared site, and that in turn led to a strong political backing through the military enforcements.

---

31 p.36
In opposition, to Catalonia and Aragon were united under one ruler, with Catalonia dominating the union until 1410 when the male line of the counts of Barcelona was discontinued.\(^{33}\) Due to the role played as part of the Crown of Aragon, Catalonia became a maritime power and main naval power leading to their expansionism into the Mediterranean. Additionally, Catalan literature flourished during this period. When King Ferdinand of Aragon wed Queen Isabella of Castile they ruled as a united force, but allowed the distinct territories to continue with their separate institutions, parliaments and laws. This union pushed Catalonia to become a secondary importance in Spanish affairs. Castile held the monopoly with the exploitations to the Americas and benefited largely from the colonial riches. Over time the political power gradually shifted away from the Aragonese and Castilian courts to the united court of the Spanish Crown.

This shift in power frustrated the Catalans; they rebelled with the help of the French in 1640. That rebellion was unsuccessful, but they did lay the foundation for the beginning of Catalan separatist movements. During the War of the Spanish Succession, Catalonia supported the archduke Charles and resisted the accession of the Bourbon dynasty stronghold in Spain. The forces under of the Bourbon Philip V insured a victory and abolished the Catalan constitution and autonomy.\(^{34}\) From here we see the repression begin to take place in Catalonia from the central government.


\(^{34}\) Ibid.
I will now move on to the early twentieth-century, during this time period Spain went through several wars along with government changes and economic developments. Galicia and Catalonia were affected differently during these events and from that their identities have developed adversely. I outline the regional differences through the backdrop the major events of the early twentieth-century.

**Early Twentieth-Century**

In 1900, the life expectancy in Spain was under thirty-five years of age, an extremely low figure when compared to the European average, which at the time was at around fifty. There was also a high infant mortality rate. The cause of such low life expectancy rates were linked to poor hygiene and sanitation, an unhealthy diet, and ignorance of the causes of diseases and how they were passed on. Another significant indicator of Spain’s lack of development was Spaniards illiteracy, that combined with the continuance of the rural way of life displayed a backward country. During this time was the spread of capitalist economic practices, beginning the economic shift to greater fragmentation and social inequality within communities and the construction of the working class identity.

Eventually, between 1900 and 1930 there was moderate growth and development. The population rose from 18.6 million to 23.5 million inhabitants, average life expectancy went from 35 to 50 years old and there were sharp declines

---

37 Ibid. p. 30
in infant mortality and illiteracy. 38 Unfortunately, I do not have the demographics per regional for a better comparison of Galicia and Catalonia.

During the years of 1898 and 1902 the Spanish economy was coping with the cost of El Desastre*, and the government raised taxes to offset the cost. Galicia experienced growth during this period, even with the changing economy effect on the rest of the country. Galicia was a mass producer of grain and this allowed them to adapt to the market. However, when the transportation revolution opened the international food trade, prices began to fall. To counter this the Spanish government introduced trade barriers. 39

The industrialized regions such as Barcelona did not have the ability to adjust to a changing market. Even with a lack of flexibility they had greater resources, more supportive relationships, and better organizational capacity than their agrarian counterparts. 40 Those advantages were used to explain the strikes and labor organizations that came out of that time.

In 1902, Alfonso XIII ascended the throne of Spain, taking on the challenges left from El Desastre. To begin change he created a program of national ‘regeneration’. 41 This involved a vow to uphold the young constitution and begin his responsibly as part of the monarch. From the discontent with the ‘regeneration’ program Catalan nationalism became a political movement with the founding of Lliga Regionalista. The group was compromised of Catalan Bourgeoisie

38 Ibid. p.102
39 Ibid. p.27
* El Desastre (The Disaster) of 1898 was the defeat of the Spanish troops by American forces after three years of combat in Cuba. Spain had lost over fifty thousand men.
40 Ibid. p. 31
41 Ibid.p. 35
who opposed the new taxes imposed on to them from the monarch. This movement of Catalan nationalism will prove to be of great importance as the twentieth century progressed.

Alfonso XIII’s first major challenge came in 1909 with the news of Semana Tragica (Tragic Week) in Barcelona. Which momentum came from Prime Minster Antonio Maura introducing a law to put an end to the spread of anarchism that year, labeled the Repression of Terrorism Bill, mobilization of the anarchists, socialist, and republicans formed. That group stood to represent the working class. An additional trigger for such outcry was the Spanish government secretly reestablished a military presence in Morocco and called for a draft. Spanish citizens were still paying for El Deastre, and did not want another war. The citizens that had just participated in active service six years earlier did not foreshadow being called back to service. Spaniards with the financial means could pay 6,000 reales for a replacement. The average salary at the time was twenty reales a day. Political Criticism was transformed and the start of the outcry against Maura began.\footnote{Ibid. 49}

The political party, Solidaridad Obrera led by anarchists and socialists called for a general strike. The violent clashes between the Spanish army and working class of Barcelona came to a head on July 25\textsuperscript{th}, 1909. It spread to other cities across Catalonia. It started by acts of vandalism, leading to halting of troop trains, overturning trams and burning of convents. They associated the Roman Catholic Church with the corrupt bourgeois. Martial law was enacted and troops from around Spain had to be called in when Barcelona based troops refused to step in.
The aftermath consisted of a combined death toll of over 124 wounded and over one thousand and seven hundred sentenced in military court. 43

After the combined events of the Disaster ’98 and Tragic Week the loose foundation of the Restoration system and the lack of hegemony of the state were revealed. The government was changed from the hands of the conservatives to the liberals. The new power of the working class was symbolized through this change. The new government authorized the Mancomunidad (Federation) of Catalonia in 1913. This new autonomous power was purely on paper since the governing body of Catalonia did not gain more strength. With the Catalan question partly dealt with, there was still a rise in tensions with the Roman Catholic Church. The church was seen as belonging to the bourgeois of the conservative party. Therefore, a link was made between the apparently corrupt powers of the conservative party with the Catholic Church.

From 1917 to 1923 the Spanish government went through four general elections and twelve prime ministers. In July 1917 the economy became paralyzed when members of every industrial sector of employment went on strike. It started in Valencia and spread through a solidarity brotherhood. Through the arrest of strike leaders and lines of communication to other cities cut off, the strike ended in September when Asturian miners returned to work. 44

In 1923 Miguel Primo de Rivera, the captain general of Catalonia, carried out a coup d’état. 45 Primo de Rivera as dictator had the motto of ‘one Spain, great and

43 Ibid. 55
44 Ibid p.63
45 Ibid p. 84
indivisible’. To strengthen national ties Primo de Rivera launched the Union Patriotic Castellana, based on the principles of ‘Religion, Fatherland, and Monarchy’. The goal of the party was to unite Spaniards ‘of good faith’. The movement never became successful and by 1929 there were plots to overthrow the dictatorship. The dictatorship of General Primo de Rivera fell in January 1930. The unrest from those years paved an uneven foundation that continued to have cracks until the momentum led that became the civil war.

This was also the time of great economic growth at a rate of five percent per year, assisted by industrial diversification and business concentration. The momentum for the civil war built upon from this economic success and came to be in 1936. That success came to a halt when the Great Depression swept from Wall Street across the world. The war ended with the nationalists as the victors in 1939.

**Franco Spain**

---

46 Ibid. p. 93
48 Ibid 95
Franco’s idea of Spain was to become one homogenous nation, with one language and culture. The Civil War in Spain lasted three harsh years. The war greatly devastated the country’s resources. Before the war, Spain was already suffering from difficult economic turmoil. During the civil war Galicia and the rest of northern Spain were the first parts to fall to Franco’s power. Franco himself was Galician; this gave him an advantage in these parts of the country. Contrasting Galicia, Catalonia was one of the last regions to be defeated.

The Spanish Civil War had bought to the forefront the hardening reality of the regional differences within Spain. There was very little fighting in Galicia, but still it was subject to violent repression and summary executions. 49 One young man’s death during the Civil war turned many Galician’s towards regionalism, once they witnessed how harsh the Franco Regime could act. They lost the sense of solidarity with the Spanish state and turned inwards towards their regional needs.

He was Alejandro Boveda, also a regionalist leader, who was executed after what a brief and bluntly biased trial.\textsuperscript{50} Boveda was seen as a threat from his talents and integrity, which earned respect from even his political opponents.

The regionalist movement in Galicia during this time focused on an economic struggle. Throughout this time Galicia’s economy still largely focused on canning plants and shipyards. \textsuperscript{51} Galicians suffered from overpopulation and high unemployment that led to high percentages of emigration to other parts of Europe, Spain, and South America. The Galician people also felt betrayal from General Franco. Since he was Galician himself, they thought he would help his home region over other Spanish regions. Although, Franco did not come out against Galician regionalism as strong as he did against Catalonia or the Basque Country, he did not extend the benefits of his industrialization policy to Galicia.

In the 1960s there was a ease of censorship, with a Chair of Galician Literature and Culture being established at Madrid University. The response by the regionalism movement was to oppose any radical separatism. While they were opposed to the dictatorship and the repression, they’d rather maintain the status quo than separation from Spain. \textsuperscript{52}

Catalonia did not submit to General Franco’s repression as easily as Galicia. Even during the early years of the dictatorship one could hear Catalan being spoken freely. Two great Catalan poets, Jose Maria Segarra and Carlos Riba were able to

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{50} Ibid. p. 403
\item \textsuperscript{51} Ibid.p.403
\item \textsuperscript{52} I.A., L. “Regionalism in Franco’s Spain”. The World Today. no.12 (1956): p.405
\end{itemize}
publish luxurious editions because the regime thought none could afford them. Other printing offices placed ‘Printed in France’, in their books as a precaution.\textsuperscript{53}

The economic policies of Franco’s Regime only strengthened the region of Catalonia. Instead of complaining of a weak economy, Catalans complained of the lack of business smarts, and greater working capacity. \textsuperscript{54} The elites blamed the government for large influx of Spaniards from other regions to ‘drown them out’. \textsuperscript{55}

With the influx of non-Catalan speakers Catalans felt they were being invaded. The Spanish Miracle of the 1960s demonstrated specular growth of industry and tourism in Catalonia, transforming Barcelona into one of Europe’s largest industrial metropolitan areas. This economic success fueled the nationalism within Catalonia. Economic strength allowed Catalans to believe they did not need the central Spanish state for survival; Catalonia could make it on their own.

\textbf{Transition to Democracy}

Map 4: Present Day Spain

\textsuperscript{53} Ibid. p. 407  
\textsuperscript{54} Ibid. p. 407  
\textsuperscript{55} Ibid. p. 407
Spain was part of the third wave of democracy that swept across southeastern Europe ending the dictatorships in Portugal, Greece and Spain. Out of those nations, Spain is the most diverse state with distinct regions and cultures. Accommodating the calls for regional rule or in some cases full fledge independence, was a balancing act many fresh democracies would not handle so well. Spain's ability to have been labeled as a successful transition is remarkable given its challenges.\textsuperscript{56}

In 1969, Franco was aware his health was failing and appointed Prince Juan Carlos to be his successor. After General Franco’s death in 1977, Prince Juan Carlos allowed the citizens to vote to decide what type of government they wanted. Around 18.5 million Spanish men and women over the age of 21 turned out to vote for the

first time in forty years. Out of the thirty-six political parties on the ballot only four
gained seats in the parliament. 57

The Moncloa Pact of 1977 is what bought Catalonia back to the negotiation
table. Within the pact was the undoing's of General Franco's economic policies.
Some main points were pensions raised by thirty percent, increase in
unemployment benefits, a move towards completely free education, the
introduction of regional languages and cultural into the criteria, subsided housing,
and agrarian reforms to end sharecropping. 58 Another important law created with
the Moncloa Pact was the Law of Public Order, which allowed for the enjoyment of
civil liberties and human rights. Together they demonstrated the politics of
consensus, and affirmed the core symbols and ritual procedures of the Spanish
Transition.

Since the transition to democracy the Spanish government was practicing
devolution, and the division of the autonomous regions took place. Subsequently,
Galicia was a region once under its own Kingdom so was permitted to be a historical
autonomous region in 1979. The same year Galician members of the Spanish
parliament submitted a draft Statue of Autonomy. In 1980 the Galician population
voted to be part of the historic autonomy regions, joining Catalonia and Basque
Country. 59 The Galician Nationalist Party did not support the Statue since it had

58 Laura Edles, The 1977 Moncloa Pacts and the ritualization of communality. In
Symbol and Ritual in the New Spain: The Transition to Democracy after Franco.
(Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1998) p. 87
Oxford. 2013 p.56
what they called limited powers when compared to the 1936 Statue of Autonomy. The 1936 Statue allowed for control over the region's economy, taxes, and a special power to claim them as a nation. Since there is no clause recognizing the right to self-determination, the nationalist parties are seen to have lost their legitimacy from that point on. Even though Galicia never got to exercise those rights from the 1936 Statue of Autonomy because they were under Franco's Regime during that time.

On the other hand, Catalonia and the Basque Country were able to practice their right to autonomy from the 1936 Statue. That reasoning alone could be why we see such a difference in the push for self-determination from the three historical regions.

Catalonia voted for the adoption of a democratic constitution that allowed limited political and cultural autonomy in the region, extending the Statue of Autonomy they held in 1932, that was later nulled in 1939. The regional government called, the Generalitat, holds exclusive jurisdiction in culture, environment, communications, transportation, commerce, communications, transportation, commerce, public safety, and local government. Catalonia shares jurisdiction with the central Spanish Government in education, health, and justice.  

**Present Time**

During the shift to democracy Galicia and Catalonia each received back significant autonomous rights, but here the divide grows. As discussed above Galicia did not have the strong backing to request additional freedoms like their counterparts in Catalonia. For the present day overview I will look at the years of 2005 until

---

2014. These were significant years for Catalan independence movements. These events led to the demand for the independence referendum of 2014. While Catalonia was on an extreme side of the scale of secessionist movements it is important to contrast that to what was happening in Galicia during that time.

In September 2005, the “Draft of New Statue of Autonomy for Catalonia” a reform proposal regarding Catalonian self-government was passed in the Catalan Parliament. From the Catalan Parliament to the Cortes Generals (Spain’s Parliament) in November of the same year, and the Spanish Congress of Deputies approved the admission. After some reforms and clarifying the definition of nation and financing the current project of statue it passed through both houses of the Parliament on May 10th, 2006. On June 18th, 2006 the Catalan people would vote in the form of a referendum approve or not approve the new statue. While the referendum was approved with seventy-four percent, the voter turnout rate was just fewer than fifty percent.

This turnout received harsh criticism from the opposition, due to the legality of the statue. Immediately after the successful passages of the new Statue of Autonomy for Catalonia the opposition Spanish Nationalist People’s Party contoured with a legal challenge to declare the new Statue unconstitutional. The debate in the courts lasted four years, coming to the conclusion that fourteen of the 277 articles were unconstitutional and twenty-seven more had to have newly defined interpretations. The judgment was made public on July 9th, 2010, and on the 10th
protest against the court ruling took place in Barcelona. The slogan of the protest was “Som una nacio. Nosaltres decidim” (We are a nation. We decide).\(^6^1\)

From there the momentum progressed and in 2012 there was another large Independence demonstration, on September 11 is the National day of Catalonia. The Catalan National Assembly teamed with the Association of Municipalities for Independence to organize the event. It was the last in the series of movements that had stemmed from June 30\(^{th}\), 2012. The protesters demanded the independence of Catalanian and its consolidation as a sovereign state under the slogan: “Catalunya, nou estat d'Europa” (Catalonia, new state in Europe).

Following two months later in November 2012, the most important elections of Catalonia’s history were held, confirmed by the seventy percent voter turnout.\(^6^2\) The elections were the consequence of Prime Minister Rajoy rejecting the discussion of a fiscal pact with Catalonia. Governor Mas responded by dissolving the Parliament and called for early elections, which took place on November 25\(^{th}\), 2012. Convergencia I Unio, Mas’ party won the majority of votes once again.\(^6^3\) By reaffirming his majority support, Mas took it as a sign to begin the process of national emancipation. In 2013 a coalition of pro-independence parties in the Catalan parliament agreed on November 9\(^{th}\) 2014 to be the date of the referendum.

In September 2014, supporters of independence took over the streets of Barcelona to celebrate Catalan National Day and to protest Prime Minister Rajoy

---

61 Artur Mas, President of Catalonia. “Prologue” A new path for Catalonia” in What’s up with Catalonia? (Catalonia Press, Ashfield, MA: 2013) p. 10
63 Ibid. p. 179
claiming the referendum illegal. He filed a compliant against the referendum with the Constitutional Court. The Court ruled the referendum was unconstitutional and null, but the questioning of Catalan people’s opinion is not illegal. There led to a declaration of consolation by holding a non-binding self-determination referendum, but in October Mas decided to define the court and continue with their original plans.

The voter turnout was under 50%, with about two million out of an estimated 5.4 million eligible voters taking part in the ballot. The result was eighty percent of the vote in favor of an official referendum. Due to the low voter turnout the vote is not seen as legitimate and there are legal actions currently being carried out against Mas by the central government.

Galicia had a spike in nationalism sentiment in 2005, after conservative Manual Fraga and his People’s Party were accused of not reacting efficiently to the oil spill off the Galician coastline. In the 2005 elections the People’s Party lost its long lasting absolute majority to the coalition of the socialist and nationalist parities. The main leader of the coalition was the Galician Nationalist Bloc (BNG). The BNG is the only nationalist party in Galicia to hold any electoral power.

The BNG formed in 1982. They advocated for further devolution of powers to the Galician Parliament, and promote affirmative action for the Galician Language. Over the years the BNG have formed coalitions with various left wing parties. In 1990, they had to abandon secessionist discourse and the claims for self-determination because of their union with moderate nationalist party Galician Unity.
In 2009 the coalition lost the elections and the power returned to the People’s Party. Then in 2012, the BNG suffered another blow when several parties left the coalition from disapproval of the leadership. Those that left formed more moderate social-democratic parties.

Voters in Galicia may choose to go for mainstream Spanish parties as long as the political party is willing to show some degree in the promotion of Galicianism. Galician identity deeply embedded in society, therefore the majority does not feel the need to vote for regionalist parties.  

Center of Sociological Investigation, Spain

The Center of Sociological Investigation in Spain is the main statistical center in the country. Catalonia has their own center of public opinion, but since Galicia lacks such a center I chose to only view the main government opinion polls. In the course of viewing the polls there were some inconsistency in the years, so I chose focus on 2010, 2012, and 2014. Despite this fact, these are still fundamental years that the momentum for the Catalonia referendum increased, and also Galician national sentiment increased during that period. Below I have organized the data into charts for easier comparison. In Table 1, below are how either Catalan and Galician residents answered with what national identity they felt most comfortable with identifying with. Highlighted in red are the Galician percentages, by placing each regions percentages side by side the differences are easily recognized.

Table 1: Catalonia or Galician Identity Sentiment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Only/More Spanish</td>
<td>16.6%/43.1%</td>
<td>10.8%/29.9%</td>
<td>5.5%/20.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal Spanish/Catalan (Galician)</td>
<td>43.9%/43.6%</td>
<td>37.6%/23.5%</td>
<td>35.9%/18.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Only/More Catalan (Galician)</td>
<td>37%/42.9%</td>
<td>49.2%/21.3%</td>
<td>58.2%/15.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CIS

From the tables it is easy to see the different nationalism sentiment felt from the citizens of each region. The percentage of persons feeling only or more Spanish in Galicia is more than double of those that feel that way in Catalonia. In Catalonia we see an increase of only or more Catalan sentiment as the independence referendum is approaching. In Galicia the feeling of only or more Galician hits a peak in 2010, when the nationalist party joined the socialist party in a coalition and gained popularity. The coalition lost such popularity through corruption schemes, and failed overarching promises made during the campaign. These percentages clearly demonstrate the different ideology on identity from the Catalan and Galician population.

From those percentages I return to Guibernau’s definition of National Identity:

“...is a collective sentiment based upon the belief of belonging to the same nation and of sharing most of the attributes that make it distinct from other nations...Collective memories of a time when the nation was independent, endured oppression, or attained international leadership tend to strengthen a sense of

65 Centro de Investigaciones Sociologicas Barometer 2010, 2012, 2014
common identity among those who belong to the nation even if it lacks a state of its own.”

Her explanation of national identity highlights the reasoning that Galicia and Catalonia could have such extreme differences in national identification sentiment. Catalonia does not believe they share a common culture, history, kinship, language or territory with Spain. As displayed above it is evident that Catalan identity pertains more so with their region; whereas, Galicians identify more with the Spanish national identity. Galicians feel they belong to the Spanish nation, and that their region is just a sector of the nation, whereas Catalans contrast that ideology.

**Symbolism**

**Regional Flags**

National symbols are large influencers on identity, and how a nation displays them varies across countries. Since regional flags are just as important in Spain as the national flag, I wanted to see how they were displayed during my research trip. I largely focused on Bilig’s “Remembering Banal Nationalism” during this section of the chapter.

When looking to Catalonia and Galicia, they were the repressed outsiders during Franco’s dictatorship. Nevertheless, Galicia was spared much of the violence during the Civil War, because of the success of the initial coup that took place in Galicia. There was some resistance to the loss of autonomy, but nothing that Franco

---


67 Ibid. 11
could not oppress quickly. Now, after thirty years, Galicia's pride seems to have stayed non-confrontational, on the other hand Catalonia's is as has progressed. Still seeking justice for years of repression, Catalonia has pushed more recently since 2006 for independence. I believe from the years of repression and economic differences are why we see the symbolic differences between the two regions.

Furthermore, Biling focuses mostly on Renan's 'cult of the United States flag'.

While most Americans do not notice its existence in public spaces, foreigners seem to take particular notice of the abundance of flags. Such strong 'Patriotism' as what it is commonly referred to in the American case is quite extraordinary. But, what I witnessed in Barcelona was along the same lines as what I would see in America, if not more so. But Catalonia has two flags that are common to see, and have specific symbolism.

Equally important Biling, looked to Firth for how Flags have historically been used to communicate messages. He highlights what Firth has pointed out in Symbols: Public and Private that the national flag preforms a symbolic function, and waving or unweaving flags carry a message. Once a nation-state becomes sovereign, flags do not disappear in reality, but disappear from the minds and become absorbed into daily life. The flags with other routine signs of nationhood are present in society but mindlessly. Though citizens know subconsciously what is expected of them when encountering such a symbol. Such as the national anthem, they may not hear it


everyday, but when they do they know how to react. Over time, those symbols of nations get washed into society and remembered for certain holidays or after tragic events. As we can reflect on the earlier examples of the flag transformations, flying Franco’s version of the Spanish Flag communicated that you supported his regime. Not displaying the flag also communicated that you disagreed with his rule. These were passive forms of support or opposition, but still important in this context.

Moving back to the autonomous regions in Spain, we can see differences in the displaying of the national flag. Reflecting on what Bilig remarked about the return of the repressed nationalism. Once oppressed under Franco, Catalans are making sure to make a splash to make up for years of repression. When one visits Catalonia, the Spanish flag isn’t as prominent as the Catalonia flag. When the votes of the referendum were taking place, the flag symbolizing independent Catalonia was being displayed outside of homes to show support for independence. There is a special flag to represent the “national flag” of Catalonia, displayed with one star to show the one nation of Catalonia.

**Figure 1: Regional Flag of Catalonia**

![Regional Flag of Catalonia](http://web.gencat.cat/ca/inici/)

Source: [http://web.gencat.cat/ca/inici/](http://web.gencat.cat/ca/inici/)

---

71 Ibid. p.43
Figure 1, is the traditional regional flag of Catalonia, that dates back to 1082 A.D. Figure 2, is the flown by Catalan Nationalist to symbolize the call for an

---

independent Catalonia in 1918. Figure 3, is the regional flag of Galicia dating to 1560 A.D. Figure 4, is the Galician Separatist flag dating from 1855. As you can see each separatist flag has a lone star. The difference is how common it is to see the separatist flag in Catalonia, and in Galicia you have to go searching for it. I was only able to spot a handful of Galician separatist flags around the region. That clearly marks a difference between the two regions and their ideas on independence.

Shifting now, to symbols dealing especially with Galician Identity.

**Gaita Gallega (Bagpipes)**

This instrument is commonly thought to be associated most often with the British Isles; however, since the XIX century the bagpipes have been affiliated with Galician identity and stand as a symbol of Galician regionalism. Commonly misconceived my most, this is actually a reflection of the Celtic roots found only in but not included in the rest of Spain. Dating back to the Middle Ages up until today the bagpipes are played at regional festivals. One of the highest honors one can have, as an Galician is to be part of the Gaita Gallega band.

During the 1990s the bagpipe reemerged to the forefront of Galician folklore. Due to the high level of emigration the Gaita Gallega has became an important symbol for the diaspora communities in the United States and Latin America.

**Concha de Vieira (Pilgrim’s Shell)**

------------

73 Ibid.
74 Maria Dolores Lopez Sanchez. “Lingua, arte e esprito”
http://www.matices.de/18/18sgalle.htm (Accessed May 21, 2015)
75 Ibid.
Here I return to the Camino de Santiago and the impact it has had on Galician identity. The shell has foundations in different myths surrounding the return of Saint James body to the Iberian Peninsula; each one relates to the overwhelming appearance of shells when his body is discovered. The grooves in the shell are to represent the routes that lead to the Camino. Each person receives a shell when they begin the journey. Around Galicia it is common to see the shell on street signs and sidewalks. Recently fellow European Union countries started placing the shell on signs in the colors of blue and yellow.

The Camino and the shell are of great pride for Galicans; this comes from the gratification of a religious pilgrimage in their region.

Moving Forward

As one can see from the historical background the political and economic development has varied greatly between Galicia and Catalonia. Through the centuries this has caused their regional relationship to develop on opposite spectrums. One extreme side of the spectrum there is Catalonia pushing to be an independent nation, and then the other side is Galicia not voicing for more autonomy.

An additional factor in the different levels of regional identification are the contrasting cultural roots found in Galicia. Through the Celtic and Spanish mixture their identity has become divided with less loyalty to either. To be Galician means to be both of a Celtic and Spanish nation.

In the following chapter I will discuss the usage of Critical Discourse Analysis in my methodology. From there I will explain my analysis and my main findings.
Methodology

Famous American songwriter Janis Joplin once said; "Being an intellectual creates a lot of questions and no answers," \(^{77}\) Beginning this analysis I had a wealth of questions that only grew with time. Do Galicians and Catalans share a common brotherhood from both being historical autonomous regions? Do Galician’s disagree with Catalonia’s separatist movement? Are Galicians looking to Catalonia as a model to follow for leaving the Spanish state? The difference from Joplin’s quote is that I end my analysis with an answer to my questions.

Critical Discourse Analysis

A critical discourse approach (CDA) challenges the idea that the accounts people provide of their thoughts, feelings and experiences are comparable to a mirror image of what is going on inside of them, in their hearts and minds. \(^{78}\) When I looked at my different sources of analysis I was trying to understand Galician’s diversity of opinions revolving around nationalism. I had to dig deeper during my interviews and look at the full context of the opinion pieces. CDA has contributions from three different authors: Norman Fairclough, Ruth Wodak and Teun van Dijk. \(^{79}\)

---


\(^{79}\) I mention Teun van Dijk, because of his connection with Fairclough and Wodak. I do not link him further to my analysis, for the lack of resources on his original publications in the library.
Jorgensen and Phillips establish that there are five basic concepts shared between the previous mentioned authors. First, the discourse analyzed refers to the formulation and dispersion of content and if from that content new social constructs are produced. Second, through a dialectical relation of what is stated and what is left to be assumed the discourse creates social processes through each persons’ understanding of the content. Third, discourse analysis shall revolve in interworking of linguistic analysis of empirical documents in their social interrelation. Fourth, the textual discourse has ideological implications by generating and regenerating dissimilar power relationships between social categories. Lastly, critical discourse analysis is not meant to be politically neutral, the producer of the content is creating a power struggle with those in power and their end goal is social transformation.\textsuperscript{80}

CDA better helps test my hypothesis that Galicians do not share the same ideology for independence as Catalonia, even though they are both historical autonomous regions. CDA allows me to focus on interactions between discourse and social constructs. The main period of analysis-July 2013 until December 2014-was a time of shifting political climate in Spain. As Fairclough states, ”What is ‘said’ in a text is always said against the background of what is ‘unsaid’- what is made explicit is always grounded in what is left implicit.”\textsuperscript{81} While some Galicians complained of the absurdity of Catalonia independence what was left unsaid was their thoughts on Galician independence. Through my coding I was able to understand the context that I will discuss later in the chapter. A deeper question I wanted to answer was


\textsuperscript{81} Norman Fairclough. Analyzing Discourse:Textual: analysis or social research. (London: Routledge, 2003) p.17
related to the relationship between Galician identity and independence movements. Hence, why I chose a discourse with the Catalan independence movement. This is why I chose to conduct a comparative approach.

Moreover, CDA allows for better explanation of my findings. For my research I combined elements of two different outlooks on critical discourse analysis: the perspectives of Fairclough and Wodak.82

Wodak’s Discursive Construction of National Identity refers to analyzing lexical units and syntactic devices. She outlines that the three most important devices are personal reference, spatial reference and temporal reference. 83 These devices were important during my coding process. Within the opinion pieces from the Galician newspapers I followed Wodak’s strategies by looking for words that imply negative sameness, for example the use of “they ‘when the author was referring to Catalans even though they are all technically Spaniards. Secondly, I looked for defensive words. For example when Galicians used words like dramatic or selfish when referring to the Catalans. I followed the same coding process for the interviews.

In Fairclough’s Analyzing Discourse: Textual analysis for social research he explains that his research, "is more concerned with the relationship between language and other elements and aspects of social life, and its approach to the

linguistic analysis of texts is always oriented to the social character of a text."^84 His research is more concentrated on the assumptions made from discourse analysis. His definition of assumptions includes three types: existential, propositional, and value assumptions (i.e. about what exists, what is the case, what is desirable or desirable). ^85 These assumptions were critical for the second half of my coding process. By examining the context of what was left unsaid but implied, I was able to see the ideology behind the text. Connected with Wodak’s coding guideline, I was able to have a substantial coding procedure for the newspaper articles and the interviews.

My research is broken down into two sections: the main focus of analysis is newspaper opinion pieces; and the second focus is the interviews I was able to conduct in Ourense, Galicia during April 2015.

Newspaper Analysis

The Galician Perspective on Catalonia

I wanted to gain a perspective of contemporary concerns of Galicians relating to Catalanian independence. While there is scholarly literature on Galicia, the focuses of the pieces tend to be related to language development and the preservation of the Galician language. I decided to review one of the oldest forms of press, newspapers, where one can find the up to date opinions of a society. Through

^85 Ibid. p. 213
analyzing their opinions towards Catalonia, I examined the underlying relation to their Galician Identity.

In this section I examine the opinion section of two Galician newspapers, *La Voz de Galicia* and *La Region*. “La Voz de Galicia” started publications in 1882 with a republican, progressive and free minded political stance. *La Voz de Galicia* is the highest circulating newspaper in Galician, and ranked eighth in all of Spain. *La Voz de Galicia* has local editorial offices in seven Galicia cities. In 1980 *La Voz de Galicia* started a radio show, and in 2010 a television program.\(^{86}\)

*La Region* is on a much smaller scale in comparison. It started publications in 1910, with the same republican political stance as *La Voz de Galicia*. *La Region* has only one office in Ourense, Galicia. In 1966 they began publishing *La Region Internacional* for the Spanish emigrants\(^ {87}\). Both newspapers publish in Spanish except for the rare occasions in Galician for culture and opinion pieces. It is important to note that even though they are for Galicians they want their viewership to expand past just Gallego speakers.

Next, I focus on how Galicians see Catalonia and their secession movement/ideology. Through that lens I will be able to decipher what has led to the Galician and Spanish versus the leaning towards Catalan identity found in Catalonia. As I focus on the Galician viewpoint, keep in mind that all authors of the newspaper articles are Galician. For this I reviewed forty newspaper articles from July 2013 till

---

\(^{86}\) All factual information was found on the official website of *La Voz de Galicia*. NA. “Historia” [http://www.lavozdegalicia.es](http://www.lavozdegalicia.es) (*Accessed May 21, 2015*)

\(^{87}\) All factual information was found on the official website of *La Region*. NA. “Historia” [http://www.laregion.es](http://www.laregion.es) (*Accessed May 21, 2015*)
December 2014. I chose the articles based on their mentioning of the Catalonia independence referendum.

One difficulty was that the articles tended to come from the same authors. There was also a male author bias; I was able to find only one article from a female journalist that related to my research. Since I focused on pure opinion pieces I ran the risk of the bias of using the same journalist. By utilizing articles from earlier in time than I had originally planned, I was able to find a variety of authors that wrote on Catalonia. After coding the articles I realized that having the same group of authors allowed me to better understand their writing styles and it became easier to code. Through having a familiarly with their writing, I believe it made my coding process stronger and less biased.

As I furthered my investigation I noticed several themes materialize. To allow for a more comprehensive understanding I have divided the articles by these themes. Additionally, in each theme I have translated a few selections from the articles to illustrate the language used by the journalists. Of the forty articles fifteen relate to political differences, five are intermixed between political and economic so I kept them within the political section, ten relate to an economic focus and the last ten deal with to cultural/historical differences. Each piece varies in length, but on average are 300-500 words.

At the end of this section I also make a brief comparison of Catalan opinion on the independence movement I was able to find a book of opinion pieces on Catalan independence during my research trip. The introduction is written by Artur Mas, the Generalitat of Catalonia. I have chosen five of the excerpts to analyze. I felt
it was important to include pieces from Catalonia to balance the analysis. The examination of how Catalans express their identity was reflected through the difference of wording used by Galicians to express their identity ties.

#### Political

For this theme I found one journalist from *La Voz de Galicia*-Roberto L. Blanco Valdes-the most insightful. He is a published author on constitutional law, history and political theory. Through his column the “The Public Eye” he observes the political environment in Spain with a critical vision, along with a commitment to pluralism, freedom and democracy. 88 Threw his articles I can tell he is left leaning, through he does explicitly side with one political party in particular.

“Mas un Bonzo? no, solo incendiario”89; this is just the title of one of the pieces I chose to analyze from Valdes. He is referring here to Artur Mas the governor of Catalonia asking if he is a bozo, then answers no just an inciter. Both nouns used to describe Mas clearly have a negative connotation. As his piece progresses the negative connotations continue. This selection from Valdes’ article illustrates his negative connotations clearly:

“...Artur Mas’ delirious resistance to accept reality could end up causing a wildfire in Catalonia and, spreading to the rest of Spain...[and this wildfire is the consequence of] Catalan nationalism proclaiming unilaterally and illegally independence.”90


90 Ibid.
The strongest examples of negative wording came from Valdes use of delirious and the phrase ‘unilaterally and illegally’. I think it is clear that he does not believe Catalonia has the right to declare independence, and therefore I believe he would have the same reasoning for Galicia. His mention of how Spain will also suffer from the Catalan independence movement, demonstrates his solidarity with the Spanish state, by not siding with a historical autonomous region.

In another article Valdes explicitly discusses the Galician nationalism movement within leftist politics, and highlights their failures:

“The leftist Galician nationalist political party with its various forms, were in opposition against almost all the essential tools that would allowed progress into this country [Galicia]...but our territorial belonging, as if being Galician, Andalusian, Basque, Catalan or Aragonese shall mark the identity of each one of us... Nationalism has sought and seeks to return these regions back to our tribal past...”91

Valdes blames the Galician Nationalist for blocking beneficial developments for Galicia. His disapproval of the Galician Nationalist illustrates his identification of being part of the Spanish nation as a whole. This is further depicted by the last sentence of the excerpt where he says our territorial belonging shall not identify us. Even though Spanish citizens belong to a territorial region this does not mean that it is their sole identity. This ideal of nationalism has a tribal outlook that Valdes views as obsolete.

I chose these two selections to illuminate Valde’s discourse with Galician identity. In the first he clearly sides with the Spanish state over Catalans attempt at

* Here the author is referring to the blockage of European Union funds for Galician highways.
self-determination. The second acknowledges the different territorial ideologies in Spain, but that this is modern times and the country is past its tribal beginnings.

After the Catalan referendum proved to be a failure, a backlash against Mas and fellow nationalist politicians was unleashed in a verbal lashing in the opinion pieces. Negative conations followed the lines of disloyal, lack of responsibility, and political suicide. I did not need to use Fairclough’s method of assumption on these articles due to their explicit wording. I examined the articles through what Wodak calls “negative presentation”. The word selection emphasized the negative ideology of the Galician journalist towards Catalan politicians. The twenty articles analyzed for this theme each had at least two negative conations towards the Catalan nationalist politicians. I can conclude that the idea of independence for any region of Spain is not a realistic option in the Galician journalists view; therefore I believe they would not press for Galician independence. As much as they believe in being Galician, they also recognize they are part of a larger nation and politics should not intervene.

**Economic Pieces**

As I have discussed earlier in this thesis there is quite a difference in the economic power of Galicia and Catalonia. When I started this analysis I assumed the economy would be discussed heavily in the pieces, but I was disillusioned. I had such an assumption, because Catalonia is constantly driving the idea that they are better off economically without being part of the Spanish state. With that as Catalonia’s main argument, I believed it would be discussed more often in the
opinion pieces. Although, the economy was discussed, the focus tended to be on regional political leaders versus the central government.

From the economic crisis of 2008, nationalism in Catalonia has been fueled by the budget cutting measures taken by the central Spanish government. Catalonia’s answer to this is not solidarity with Spain, but to close their doors. One author highlights this well through his response to Catalan solidarity:

“In this broth cooked by the crisis, asymmetric shock and resurgent nationalism...[the crisis] increases the lack of solidarity by imposing the ideal of 'every man for himself ‘...for example the Catalan nationalist defiance... “92

Clearly, this implies that during economic hardships fellow countrymen should be helping one another, not closing their doors. By “Catalan nationalist defiance” the author draws on his solidarity with the Spanish state. He does not mention Galicia explicitly, but his underlying anger towards Catalonia is from the struggle he sees in Galicia. With knowing that Catalonia is still doing well even with the crisis he could be holding a grudge against them.

This next passage draws upon the same emotion as displayed above:

“Catalan, and its political heirs have led to a scenario of illusion wrapped in flags of independence, but they are forgetting the realities of social cuts and impoverishment throughout the rest of the country. For this I say to them: ‘ who says who Is being robbed?’ ”93


The author is using Catalonia's popular propaganda slogan ("Spain is robbing us"), against them, “to call into question their own actions. Changing the public's attention from the national economic crisis to the crisis of Catalonia, the improvised people in all of Spain are losing a voice. Who is robbing whom at this point? The author clearly does not approve of Catalonia's actions, and this reinforces his solidarity with Spain.

The last extract I have chosen to share for this section, has a mixture of the judgment on the social and economic injustices being carried by Catalonia:

“…Nationalism, thinks only of his belly and obsessed delusions of grandeur, and cannot forget that Spain is in an extremely serious economic and social situation which, thanks to Mas and company, [the economic and social situation] has virtually disappeared from our public debate, which, besides from being nonsense, is a tremendous injustice to those who are having hard time.”

Here again Valdes uses a fierce negative tone towards Catalonia and nationalism in particular. The ‘injustice’ being portrayed by Catalonia in the media has shifted the larger picture of what is happening in Spain. When he speaks of those having a hard time, I assume he is referring to Spanish citizens as a whole. While Galicia is struggling, so are many other parts of Spain.

I chose those three passages because of their disagreements with the Catalan nationalism movement. Furthermore, from their disapproval of the nationalism movement they correlate to the publics shift from solving social and economic problems to the ‘Catalan Question’. This continues to prove their identity as Spaniards, not just Galicians.

---

In this section I used Faircloughs theory of assumption, because of the amount of metaphors used. By using metaphors the author leaves the underlying interruption to the reader. From my perception of the metaphors the journalist do not appreciate the Catalonia Referendum, especially since in their opinion revolving the issues from the 2008 economic crisis are of more importance. The referendum has changed the national discussion and that is not in the countries best interest. Additionally, the economic crisis has hit Galicia especially hard since they already were lacking the economic industry. This led me to believe that the Galician journalists hold a grudge against the Catalans for shifting the attention of the nation.

**Cultural/Historic Pieces**

A few opinion pieces compared the Catalan culture to Galician, but most journalists reflected their judgments on Catalan culture through Galicia’s relationship with nationalism. As I have covered earlier in the historical background, the different levels of economic and industrial development have greatly affected the cultural and historical development in each region.

To point out once again, there was an upsurge in Galicia nationalism in 2009 and that is when Galician politician Pachi Vazquez was able to gain ninety percent of the votes, but then failed to carry out a strong nationalist movement.  

95 One journalist relates Catalonia independence to a hypothetical movement:

“Catalan Socialists appeal has returned the mood [to independence]... Do they [Catalan Socialists] follow in the footsteps of the former leader of the Galician

---

Socialists, Pachi Vazquez, who also fought for a primary to which he did not obtain a victory.” 96

He accuses Artur Mas of following the footsteps of Pachi Vazquez and will also find failure, he recognizes that Galicia did once have a nationalism movement but nothing will come of such movements. He observed from the Galician nationalist politics failure that Galicia does not have the mindset for independence. Reconfirming that Galicians as a whole do not seek independence, but still recognize their separate identity.

The last extract shows the true nature of Galicians and their outlook on life:

“Galicians gather elements more suited to their vital needs with a large dose of humor, laziness and even cheekiness... They have a natural innovativeness to turn regular items into recycled art, for example a canoe with a beach chair tied on top (the sillagua)... Meanwhile, the Catalan sovereignty process has been an uninterrupted succession of social, political, legal and historical recycling. 97

This article has a word play with the idea of recycling. While Galicians recycle unused items to make them useful again, like the example from above if taking the beach chair and creating a more comfortable seat on a canoe. Catalans contrast Galicians by recycling history. He is meaning that Catalans repeat history and it is not useful in any sense. This author praised the Galician innovativeness and displayed disapproval of Catalonia. It is clear he is proud of his Galician Identity and culture.

These last articles were chosen because of their highlights of different parts of Galician history and culture. Both recognize the distinctness of Galician culture from that of Catalonia. As highlighted in these articles, Galicians do not boast about their culture, as displayed in Catalonia.

Through reviewing this section of the newspaper I combined Wodak and Fairclough methods for my analysis. The journalists are leading me to look at the underlying text, and come to my own assumptions through their use of metaphors. They understand that breaking from the Spanish state is unrealistic and do not even play with the idea of it happening in Galicia. They make it clear that it is unrealistic to secede both economically, and constitutionally.

**Catalan on Catalonia Independence**

When in Barcelona I was able to purchase the book, *What’s up with Catalonia?*. Within the book there are thirty-five Catalan experts that give their explanation for the separation of the region. I would like to point out that the book is written in English, instead of Catalan. The reasoning behind this, is from what I believe is assurance the wider English-speaking world has a chance to read it by the wider distrubtion possiblites. I chose five of the excerpts from the book to read for a short analysis. The Catalan Experts consistently blamed the Spanish government for ‘caging’ them. The strongest statements of negativity towards the central government came from Artur Mas:

“We have realized that in the same way that Spain went through a transition thirty years ago, it is now time for Catalonia to go through its own national
transition...We want to center our national transition on the right to self-determination based on sovereignty and democracy...” 98

From Mas’s usage of self-determination, I return to Horowitzs’ idea of consociation democracy.99 From what the Catalan experts campaign for is largely financial allocation, which could be achieved through consociation democracy. Secession is generally not the answer and can exacerbate a problem. Since Catalonia already has cultural autonomy, their main issue is with the economy.

Clearly, we can see that Catalonia and Galicia have strong feelings but towards different targets. When applying the negative word coding to these pieces, I get the same response from them towards the central government as the Galician journalists towards Catalonia.

**Interviews**

The interviews I conducted were only to supplement the analysis of the newspapers; they were done on a much smaller scale than most researchers recommend. I was lucky to have worked for the Xunta de Galicia from September 2013 till June 2014, and that allowed me to have an excellent foundation of interviewees.

For my interviews I wanted to talk to three different generations, the first being the one to grow up during the Franco Dictatorship, second the generation that came to age during the transition, and the last generation those who only know

---

98 Artur Mas I Gacarro, President of Catalonia. “Prologue” A new path for Catalonia” in *What’s up with Catalonia?*. (Catalonia Press, Ashfield, MA: 2013) p. 11
democratic Spain. The interviews were conducted in Spanish, and I have translated them for use in this analysis.

**Ourense, Galicia**

In Ourense I conducted six one-on-one interviews and two group discussions. One group discussion was made up of persons from age twenty to thirty, and the second group discussion was composed of persons thirty-five to sixty. For the generation that grew up under Franco I was able to speak to: two women, three people that came of age during the transition and one person who was part of the generation that grew up under democratic Spain.

The generation that grew up under Franco did not have such a nationalistic sentiment, like I had expected. While they did express anger at the oppression and hardships, they were more saddened by the migration that took place. Many neighborhoods lost all, but a few families, and that was hard to watch for those that were left behind. While this generation speaks Galician as their main language, they understand the importance of not only speaking Castellan but also English. They also expressed their annoyance with the Catalan independence movement. My favorite analogy with respect to this came from Beatrix. When we were discussing the upcoming elections in May, I was able to turn the conversation towards Catalan Independence.

“Catalans remind me of my youngest son... (She begins the back story) I was busy running the house while my husband worked during the week in Madrid. I learned after five kids to let them tire out while throwing a tantrum. After some minutes I would go over and make sure they were rational once again or ignore it if I knew the situation was not dire. Nowadays, that would be labeled child abuse, but those were different times. Here we have the same situation as with my Diego, we have to be patient and let them tire and then it will be like it never happened.”
Beatriz illuminates the lack of imagined community with Catalonia. Her underlying identification as Spaniard, than Galician does not allow her to understand Catalonia’s need for independence. By letting the Catalan independence referendum run its course, it will soon end with little attention paid to it.

Surprisingly the group that came of age during the transition was the least nationalist out of the three groups. They were not taught Galician in school, but spoke it at home with their families. While they knew of the horrors of the civil war from their parents, they mostly felt a disconnect with it. When discussing Catalan independence, they more or less repeated the earlier sentiment that separation is unrealistic to actually occur. So, there is no need to really feed into the hype created in politics. The largest complaints came from how corrupt Spanish politics have become and how Galicia has been overlooked for industrial employment.

The youngest generation I interviewed were quite mixed on levels of nationalism. Several interviewees told me it was important to keep the culture and especially the language. Others did not even speak Galician or see the importance in knowing it. This divide came from those raised in the urban center and those raised in the villages around Ourense. Those raised in the city do not see the need to keep focused on Galician historical background, and they identify as Spanish. Furthermore, those raised in the villages felt it was important to keep traditions alive, they do not see independence as a realistic option for Galicia. The most interesting analogy related to me from this group came from Manuel a master’s student still living at home, and he does not speak Galician fluently.

“Galicia seeking independence would be like trying to move out of your parent’s house with no income. Pointless...”
Manuel clearly does not support Galician independence. His identity was more aligned with being Spaniard than Galician. I found him to be an outlier in that ideology. He seems to be understanding of Catalans pushing for independence since they have the economical capacity.

**Conclusion of Analysis**

From my combined analysis of Galician opinion pieces and interviews, I have confirmed my hypothesis that different historical tracks can lead two separate regions of a county to have different levels of regionalism. On one side of the spectrum we have the push for full independence in Catalonia, and at the opposite side we have Galicia where they are at peace with where they stand within the Spanish state. In Catalonia there has been harsh oppression mixed with large levels of economic development. That blend has created a boisterous minority, that believes in their right to secede. In contrast, Galicia has had relatively lower levels of repression and low levels of economic development. This has created a region that more heavily relies on the center. While Galician identity is still kept among Galicians, they hold solidarity to the Spanish state.
Final Conclusion

The discourse between national and regional identity has largely been focused on causations between separate countries, and their respective minority groups. Through my focus on one country with a comparative examination of two regions, I was able to explain why there are secessionist movements on different scales, when theoretically both could have just as strong causation for independence.

The imagined community in Catalonia has closer ties to their region. That was displayed in the statistics for national sentiment from the Center of Sociological Investigation. As we remember Galicia had been identified to have a strong connection to the Spanish nation. As Anderson states, the unity comes from the sense of cultural togetherness. From my interviews and the opinion pieces, I know Galicians have a sense of cultural unity, but lacks the same unifying strength as the Catalans. I was able to illustrate that the reasoning for their different ideologies stem from their different political and economical development tracks. Due to the long history of oppression in Catalonia, the citizens have turned to resent the central government; while on the other hand; Galicia has had to lean on the central government more for financial backing.

With respect to the symbols of Galicia, there is a combination of Celtic and Spanish symbols. The most widely known symbols relate to the Celtic past, creating

---

a hybrid blend of traditions. To be Galician means to be both Celtic and Spanish. To be part of the bagpipe bands or to have walked the Camino de Santiago gives them a sense of closeness to their region, but they also recognize they are part of a larger nation.

While I was able to prove my hypothesis I found it interesting how the spread of identity across two distinct cultures can lower the push for secession. This unique region in Spain is often overlook and in future research I hope to further develop my findings with greater resources and ample time.
Bibliography


Centro de Investigaciones Sociologicas Barometer 2010, 2012, 2014


Gomez, Jose Luis. “Primarias sin Entusiasmo.” *La Region.*


Mas, Artur President of Catalonia. “Prologue” A new path for Catalonia” in *What’s up with Catalonia?*. (Catalonia Press, Ashfield, MA: 2013)


Sanchez, Maria Dolores Lopez. “Lingua, arte e esprito”
[http://www.matices.de/18/18sgalle.htm](http://www.matices.de/18/18sgalle.htm) (Accessed May 21, 2015)


