SECURITY THREATS AND ETHNIC CONFLICT: THE CASE OF COLOMBIAN INDIGENOUS PEOPLE

By
Nikita Bykov

Submitted to
Central European University
Department of International Relations and European Studies

In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts

Supervisor: Professor Laszlo Csaba

Word count: 14,149

Budapest, Hungary
2010
Abstract

Notion of the category of Security becomes particularly essential in the emergency situations of violent armed conflicts. The threats posed in the unleashed armed conflict are many-fold regarding their nature and objects and are generated by complex dynamics of the conflict. Threats and violence therefore are not limited only by armed confrontation and physical injuries. The vulnerability of the silenced groups in such conditions is very complex and hardly can be overcome with simple military intervention. The paper develops the concept of ‘emancipation’ as a way to provide security by international community to such vulnerable/silenced groups. The idea is elaborated on the case of indigenous peoples in Colombia.
Acknowledgements

This piece of work I dedicate to all who find any sense in it.
I pay tribute to those who think the matter is worth living and striving for.
Special gratitude I would like to my family who all that time was living nine hours ahead but whose constant support I feel every moment of my existence.
I thank those who were with me mentally and emotionally listening to my complaints and making me move forward no matter what: Mariana García Mora,
- those who were patient enough with me giving inspiration in the periods of extreme desperation: Sandra Milena Cardozo Lozano,
- those who provided essential insights: Andrés Camilo Artunduaga Abril,
- those who were always ready to provide necessary guidance and recommendations: Laszlo Csaba,
- those who work for peace, multiculturalism and co-existence: my close friends from the team of Gernika Gogoratuz and especially to Naira Ormaetxea, who selflessly contributed into the work with timely technical assistance,
- those who regardless everything maintained the sense of humanity, compassion and solidarity: Sophie, Masha, Anatolik, Zheka, Sasha, Pao, Marty, Snoozan, Besar and all those with whom I was lucky enough to share the common MA experience, but whose names I don’t put down due to the time constraints,
- those who with good faith and fidelity dedicated their time and energy on our education.

Thank you,
Gracias,
Köszönöm,
Eskerrik Asko
Спасибо.
# Table of Contents

Introduction............................................................................................................................1

Chapter 1 – Conflict Structure ............................................................................................5
1.1 Conflict and violence in general ....................................................................................5
1.2 Structural vision of the conflict .....................................................................................6
  1.2.1 Armed actors ..........................................................................................................7
  1.2.2 Drug trafficking ......................................................................................................9
  1.2.3 Other factors.........................................................................................................12
1.3 External involvement ..................................................................................................13

Chapter 2 - Threats and Vulnerabilities.................................................................................17
2.1 Critical Security Approach ..........................................................................................17
2.2 Indigenous Peoples in Colombia .................................................................................21
2.3 Land and Environment ...............................................................................................24
2.4 Globalization and conflict ...........................................................................................29

Chapter 3 - Security and Emancipation.................................................................................34
3.1 Responsibility to Protect vs. Emancipation.................................................................34
3.2 Experience of Indigenous self-development ...............................................................38
3.3 International incursion.................................................................................................44

Conclusion ...........................................................................................................................47

Appendices...........................................................................................................................50
  Appendix 1 - List of Indigenous Organizations in Colombia .............................................50
  Appendix 2 - Map of Indigenous Population in Colombia ...............................................51

Bibliography.........................................................................................................................52
Introduction

Security is a complex and diverse category bearing a strong emotional message. Security from its physical component has transformed into social obsession addressing multiple issues of daily life and overall human existence in the contemporary world. This is demonstrated simply through the emergence of numerous word combinations in which appears the term. With this notion the category of Security becomes particularly essential in the emergency situations of violent armed conflicts. Here the matters of security (in broad meaning), conflict resolution and peace-building seem to converge. The threats posed in the unleashed armed conflict are many-fold regarding their nature and objects and are generated by complex dynamics of the conflict.

The existing literature provides several approaches, that highlight various aspects of the topic. To start with the general theoretical base to study the conflict Chandra Lekha Sriram and Olga Martin-Ortega propose that the nature of the conflict itself would depend from the nature and culture of the participating parties. In this context there appear several approaches. Sriram and Martin-Ortega studying the issue of human rights in various international, civil and ethnic conflicts adhere the behavioral approach. C.R. Mitchell in his book “The Structure of International Conflict” argues that international conflict is best understood through application of structural approach. Thomas Saaty and Joyce M. Alexander worked out in some sense similar ‘analytic hierarchy approach’ which considers a conflict as a hierarchical structure which diversifies the elements of a complex system into different sets known as levels of the hierarchy. Johan Galtung reasoning the essence of peace and violence significantly turned the discourse of conflict and peace broadening by categories of direct, structural, and cultural violence. In some sense the concept of structural violence overlap with this structural approach but it presupposes that ending a direct violence would not resolve the conflict if the structural grievances remain. What is important in this context is that actors
may contribute to it unintentionally without even realizing it. Gerald Schneider and Katherine Barbieri (“Globalization and Armed Conflict”) in this regard consider the questions of how globalization is capable either contribute to conflict or mitigate it.

The question with violence conceptually touches upon the issue of victims, which are normally far from holding guns in the arms. Ken Booth raises the topic of security of victims and states that when the group is silenced and cannot make a claim of its insecurity someone has to take the responsibility to provide this security for them. This condition raises questions over the ‘responsibility to protect’ which become vitally important in the cases when state fails to provide it.

As an international norm ‘responsibility to protect’ is applied in the especially grave cases such as genocide or ethnocide. Regarding the volumes of literature dedicated to the experiences of humanitarian intervention in various parts of the world and practicing the military security the efficiency of such attempts to secure the potential victims is quite questionable. Moreover, existential threats do not refer solely to direct physical violence. One of the challenges for security studies is to explore the best way to respond when sovereign states are unable to protect their citizens from mass killing, ethnic cleansing and overall group survival in broad meaning. Thereafter the search for alternative ways to protect is objectively necessary. Ken Booth advocates emancipation as a way to confront insecurity. And for the Critical Security Studies the question of emancipation represents an important category for discussion. In this regard the ‘responsibility to protect’ and ‘emancipation’ seem to be related. However, there arise multiple several questions over the nature of emancipation; the way it can be connected to responsibility to protect; its meaning for silenced groups such as indigenous people; and the role of international community in this regard; and whether state’s ability to manage the security matters should be or can be ceded to non-state actors.
In order to answer these questions I focus on the particular case of Colombia which combines all of the described categories. Socio-political armed conflicts during the history of the country have undergone several transformations and are extensively diverse in their depth and environment. Today the conflict situation engrosses the whole country affecting the society at all levels and sectors of human development. The conflict integrates various social, cultural, economic, and political aspects which cause catastrophic ecological consequences and contributes to social fragmentation. As a common feature of armed conflicts, it has national and regional border crossing ramifications.

The conflict in Colombia appears to me to be a special case different from other ethnic, separatist, religious etc. conflicts (though I must admit that each and every one is unique), due to its complexity and magnitude of range of involved parties. First of all there are several military and paramilitary groups which directly conduct violent activities, and none of these groups has a clear articulated political agenda and objectives. There emerges the question of the sense and idea of entire fighting (struggle in the name of what?). Obviously an important issue maintaining the violence is the drugs related activity (including cultivating, processing, trafficking), nevertheless I would argue that drugs issue is not principal cause and driving force of the problem.

Indigenous people appear to be the most vulnerable group facing various existential threats intertwining physical, cultural, economic, environmental, etc. My personal idealistic world views (that saving human lives and preservation communities from vanishing are the paramount objectives of resolution of any armed conflict) bring me to the ideological position that (in)security of indigenous people should be a basic category of the research.

In order to address these objectives properly in my case I would use structuralism as a theoretical approach. It would perfectly correspond to the specificity of the case and provide
an explicit interpretation of the events in the first chapter. In the second chapter I would consider insecurity of indigenous people as integral component of the structure based on the violence is to say conflict per se. Here I concentrate on the vulnerabilities and actual exposure to threats. The third chapter is dedicated to the concept of emancipator politics and their implications in the case.

In respect to methodology, under the assumption that establishment of connections between variables and elements are crucial, research is going to be interpretive conveying in explanation of facts, events and data. With this purpose I have selected the mixed methods strategies of enquiry, comprising both qualitative and quantitative approaches. Thereafter I collect, analyze and try to interpret both kinds of data, including facts, events, discourses, opinions (derived from various statements, reports and investigations) as well as statistical numerical data concerning the population rate, magnitude of victims, displaced people and migrants, etc. In order to understand the situation I appeal to historical analysis. Also as an important method of enquiry I’m going to apply are interviews with the coordinators of actual development projects on the ground. Thus I believe the research from one hand would elaborate some theoretical contribution and from another it would have practical significance.
Chapter 1 – Conflict Structure

1.1 Conflict and violence in general

Colombia is one of the dynamic and urbanized countries of the region maintaining the stable economic growth but at the same time sharp social polarization and high poverty rate characterize the actual situation in the social life. From the declaration of the independence Colombia has always maintained a democratic state status with functioning democratic political institutions and regular presidential and parliamentary elections. The Constitution of 1991 has abolished de jure the limitations on political activity of opposition and enhanced the opportunities for civil participation in decision-making and declared the basic individual rights and freedoms. Nevertheless in practice the country is stricken with the complex political violence and as a consequence suffers from high crime rate in the social sphere. The basic source of the violence is the activity of leftish radical and ultra rightist armed groups along with governmental military forces. Unlike the other Latin American states (Peru, Guatemala, Chile, Argentina, etc.) where the armed opposition either was suppressed, transformed or disappeared from political arena, the Colombian guerillas remain the key subject of the conflict which in its turn has become a constant characteristic of the political processes projecting its effects on the regime and psychology of society in general. As notes Manuel Salamanca the long duration of the armed conflict has negative long playing social effects changing perceptions and attitudes of both actors and victims (displaced persons, children orphans, kidnapped persons, single mothers, etc) towards the violence.\(^1\) That is that society gets used to the violence and allows it to penetrate into various spheres of social life as a norm.

---

Historically the conflict has undergone several stages and cardinal transformations in structure and essence as whole. Its roots can be traced back to the urban uprising called ‘el Bogotazo’ in 1948. Then the conflict between liberal and conservative parties during 1950s known as ‘la Violencia’ gradually transformed into left-wing guerilla upraising in 1960-80s. During this period the problem had capability to hamper the country’s economic development and directly affect those who take part in the conflict and also the local population in the remote rural areas.

Transformation of the conflict during 90s has introduced violence in the daily social life affecting most of citizens. The causes of violence have changed as the remote leftish guerilla insurgency (namely represented by FARC and ELN) has turned into the full scale civil war involving multiple paramilitary groups and drug cartels (in particular cartels of Cali and Medellin). These transformations were fostered by changes in both external (end of Cold War, global illicit drug trade) and internal (political democratization and economic restructuring imposed by the Washington consensus) situations.

1.2 Structural vision of the conflict

The conflict in Colombia can be characterized as intractable which does not imply renouncement of possibility of its resolution or transformation rather it expresses the necessity of seeking for necessary means to achieve results in treatment of difficulties in the peace process. The compound of the multiple elements of the contemporary confrontation converts in a complex manner the dynamics of the structure adding other components of the high perturbation capabilities like drug trafficking and its direct influence on the committing violent acts.
From the very beginning of the current stage of the crisis there were undertaken numerous costly peace-building endeavors addressing political and military solutions along with social issues of violence. Colombian violentólogos have elaborated threefold categorization of common violence in the country. According to this rough categorization there are political, economic and social violence identified by the primary motivation referred to gain either political economic or social power either by legal and illegal actors. Therefore political violence refers to the armed conflicts of government, guerillas and paramilitary groups. Economic violence implies street crime, drug trafficking, abductions, etc. And social violence is adding up to the interpersonal, family violence and gender related abuses (as sexual harassment).  

In order to locate these three types of violence together and establish relation with the multiple involved actors and causes/factors the structural approach to the conflict exhibits these connections in a transparent manner. The conflict appears as a complex system which for convenience can be divided on at least two levels of dynamics. The first level corresponds to the internal context of the direct and structural violence involving the activities of the armed actors and respective consequences for victims whose victimized predicament is also unalienable component and is not a mere consequence of the armed violence. The second level refers to the external intervention which although often overlooked seems to shape the first level. The second level is more complex due to the activity of multiple more powerful actors which vary in their goals, practices, authority, projected influence and obviously effects.

1.2.1 Armed actors

Throughout the transformation of the conflict number of involved actors has expanded from guerillas and government military to drug cartels and right wing paramilitaries. These

---

process increased spacial density and network overload due to activity of various parties. Therefore the country’s most conflict areas are those where the interests of two or more present actors clash with each other.

In respect to the confrontation between the armed actors it is necessary to explain some specificity of the case. The conflict in Colombia due to the presence of more than two armed actors and complex relations between them which hardly can be understood as unambiguous direct confrontation has its own polygonal dynamics of interrelated organized violence. The interpretation of the significance of the adversaries in the conflict is quite complicated because various actors of internal confrontation are related rivals. From one hand there exist legal troops whose essence presupposes them to confront illegal forces. Their assignment to protect order and security puts them in the position with double opposition – counter guerillas and paramilitaries. But from other hand it is no secret (even though hard to prove) that at least in its origins and numerous recent cases there took place collaboration between government military forces and paramilitary groups with the purpose to combat the ‘common enemy’ – guerillas.

At the same time the situation is worsened by decline of state presence in the remote areas or zones controlled by armed insurgents or paramilitaries. In this regard Kent Eaton argues that decentralization reform of political authority with respective provisions in economic sphere over revenues and expenditure has complicated the security issues in several aspects. First of all these reforms were taken up by leftish armed groups in order to expand domination in the vast areas during 1990s and implement post Cold War ideological transition from “fight for land reform” (lucha por la tierra) to the “fight for territory” (lucha por el territorio).3 These conditions were stipulated by the decreasing influence of the national government and therefore the control of sub-national authorities was becoming more useful.

---

Right-wing groups have also benefitted from the reform by penetrating into the municipal authority structures via informal and illegal ties with local police and military.

Here I would like to elaborate more on the role of the territory issue as one of the inherent structural factors that maintains the violence. Territory in its broad meaning and perception as resource generating violent competition maintains the circle of the violent control going on. This circle is self-organizing and has some inertia. The armed struggle is sustained by the necessity of territory control which in its turn must be appropriated through armed violence in a manner that armed actors are fighting for resources which in their turn are used to maintain the functioning of the system of armed conflict. Therefore the motivations of the fighting are mixed with the ambitions and aspirations which affect daily life of the civil population directly or indirectly involving as collaborators or victims (Manuel E. Salamanca “Un Ajedrez del Conflicto p 30). The control of the territory by illegal armed groups does not imply only its appropriation but also the rest of the matters related to the population on these territories. The rationality of the treatment and administration of locals is often expressed in most perverted forms such as collective assassination as the way of put across a message.

1.2.2 Drug trafficking

Another important structural factor on the current stage of the conflict causing economic and political violence is the illicit drug production. From the very beginning I would like to clear out that drug issue is not the initial cause of violence rather a secondary problem derived to a large extent from the territory matter. Colombia is one of the largest coca cultivation and processing countries on the continent. The cocaine boom in 1970-80s reshaped the picture involving both guerillas and paramilitary groups into the drug trade. Thus

---

4 (Salamanca 2008, 28)
the conflict has changed its orientation and character prolonging the direct armed violence which has taken more than 350,000 lives and displaced 3.2 million people.\textsuperscript{5}

The related sorts of violence vary in scale and intensity. First of all the production and trafficking presupposes the violent activity of the organized crime groups. Drug traffickers interfere into political process through large financial support (the most famous example of Pablo Escobar enjoy unlimited power in Medellin and subsequently gaining the seat in national parliament). Second, violence fosters militarization of fight against drugs and leads to the legitimization of resorting to force by government military and police. Particular concern of the military evoke the frontier areas with neighboring states due to the unstable situation characterized by combination of drug trafficking and insurgency that afflict Colombia, Brazil and Peru. Since drug trafficking is the border crossing phenomenon generated inequalities can compel the local populations to join insurgency in these countries. Military in its turn is particularly anxious to prevent establishment of respective connections.\textsuperscript{6} And third, distribution and consumption generate the disorganized violent environment in the form of urban crime.\textsuperscript{7}

Drug trafficking is the crucial igniter of the conflict since the first is an essential finance source of the war. Thus the industry provides partial funding of the guerilla groups whereas paramilitaries are dependent directly from trafficking. Also entire discourse of war against drugs does not differentiate between the struggle against trafficking and terrorism and therefore unites drug trafficking with the conflict (José Aristizábal García, "Metamorfosis p 87").\textsuperscript{8}

\textsuperscript{7} (World Bank 1999, 5)
\textsuperscript{8} José Aristizábal García, Metamorfosis: Guerra, Estado y Globalización en Colombia (Bogotá: Ediciones Desde Abajo, 2007), 87.
Nevertheless although there is present intertwined relation between various armed actors and drugs the conflict is more profound and does not descend only from the trafficking issue. The most important difference is that guerilla is a political project whereas trafficking is explicitly commercial phenomenon. Though conflict and drug trafficking have been related since 80s this unity is not inseparable. The resolution of the first would not mean the termination of the second.

As notes Colombian sociologist Alfredo Molano, the problem is more complex than simply drugs. It is originated from the social and political structure which reproduces and increases economic inequality, armed conflict, institutional corruption and violence. Therefore attempts to terminate the drug trafficking without addressing its roots only aggravate the situation. Approaching the problem with drugs as principal igniter omits the structural causes of the conflict and considers drug trafficking as a fundamental source of existence of guerilla groups.

Noteworthy that even if the drug question (which is not limited only by planting and producing coca but also poppy and marihuana) is more consequence than the cause of the conflict it has complicated the situation significantly due to the developed economic dependence of huge amount of local population from the cultivation. Drug production has converted into important income item of vast section of the population. Taking into consideration historical social and economic conditions of living of many peasant families, the illegal cultivation is related with excluded and marginalized population lacking the integration into national community, which in its turn considers them as criminals. Thus with the coca boom of the 70s the colonization of the Amazon region acquired a new character attracting criminals. In the early 1980s when FARC gained the control over the coca planting in the area demanding that at least one third of the cultivation territories should be assigned to

---

9 Alfredo Molano Bravo, “El Plan Colombia y el conflicto armado”, in Plan Colombia: ¿Seguridad nacional o amenaza regional?, ALOP-CEPES (Lima: ALOP-CEPES, 2001), 44.
planting the substance crops.\textsuperscript{10} With the pushing FARC out of Caquetá by the army the coca growing was terminated in the area which led to the deterioration of living conditions and destitution along with consequent increase of armed violence.

1.2.3 Other factors

The picture of causes of violence appears to be complex and many-sided if we take into consideration three types of violence which act differently on the various levels and have different causes each. It is important to mark out several factors shaping the situation: minor state presence on some parts of the territory; criminalization of some forms of social and political protest; high rate of corruption; social acceptance of violence as method to resolve disputes; economic, political and social fragmentation of the society; authority of local leaders undermines the state efficiency in the respective areas.\textsuperscript{11}

In regard to political violence World Bank experts single out several problem fields around which the causes tend to revolve. First of all historical legacy of violence refers to the consequences of \textit{La Violencia} (1946-1964) taking about 200,000 lives, destroying economic infrastructure and institutional networks, and displacing over two million of peasants. Displacement initiated in this period evolved into a dramatic tendency provoking further violence. On the current stage this factor is associated with the land issue. Land appropriation is achieved by means of displacement through threat or homicide and savage treatment of the civilian population.

Second, unequal access to economic resources (land and natural resources as key components) takes a significant part in stimulating violence. Agrarian reforms intending to address to these issues always ended up exacerbating the situation. Left wing guerillas originating from the remote communities take this question in order to gain support of


\textsuperscript{11} (World Bank 1999, 8)
dispossessed peasants and enhance their activity. Third, unequal access to political power resulted in the formation of armed social movements organized by either non-traditional political groups or indigenous communities. Fourth problem field refers to the relation of militant activity with drugs production. Thus, in late 70s left wing insurgent groups (FARC and ELN) regulated the coca market imposing the taxes to the local farmers, producers and traffickers. This sort of activity could not help not to generate counteraction by landowners, drug traffickers, the number of which increased due to the government inability. The conservative government of Guillermo León Valencia (1962-1966) through the regulation of state of siege 3398 from 1965 legally perpetuated the creation of paramilitary groups. Then in 1968 the liberal government of Carlos Lleras Restepo adopted as permanent norm the organization of civil armed patrols. The first such paramilitary group became Muerte a Secuestradores (MAS) organized by 223 mafia chiefs in 1981 with the purpose of targeting guerilla groups.\(^\text{12}\)

During 90s the paramilitary activity became even more diverse. These dynamics demonstrate the intense competition for control of territory and coca cultivation as the mostly discussed matter. Legalization of the formation of these groups turned out to have dramatic consequences aggravating the complexity of violence due to the immediately increased number of the armed actors. This provision has intensified the rivalry for the territory with subsequent projections on the land ownership, internal displacement and humanitarian crisis.

### 1.3 External involvement

Along with the internal actors the predicament is deteriorated by the external involvement. As a brief insight it is worth to mention that as many other Latin American countries Colombia receives neoliberal restructuring aid package promoted by the international funding organizations like World Bank. Many countries pueblos raise explicit

---

objections against free trade agreements the country has been engaged in, which hit the poor more by structural regulations. Thus the forest management laws promoted by President Uribe administration expose the indigenous territory to the corporate interests.\textsuperscript{13}

The connection between internal conflict and external is not limited only by the characteristics of global economic system (on which I’m going to elaborate more below). The conflict has been influenced by the key international political actors. In this regard involvement of the United States is standing out on the background of the multiple international bodies due to the growing dependence of Colombia from Washington during the last two decades. The members of the CIP FUHEM mark out four external provisions transforming internal conflict. First of all with the end of the Cold War the alliances between guerilla groups and key political figures of the socialist camp came to an end. Along with cutting off the financing collapse of the Soviet Union signified the ideological breakdown. However the foreign policy of the country did not take a lot of effort to promote conflict resolution initiatives in the international institutions. The relations with the US as a priority of the Colombian foreign policy assumed that the conflict would vanish as an expression of Cold War and positioned the fight with drug-trafficking as primary objective. The political dependence on the Washington hampered the internationalization of the political activity facing the armed conflict.\textsuperscript{14}

Second provision refers to the diplomacy for peace by government of the President Pastrana and more active participation of the international community. This internationalization although made some effort to involve UN and other states in the peace process, was still based on the construction of the strong bilateral relations with the US. The administration of Bill Clinton perceived Colombia as a problem country capable to generate


instability in the region, growing drug producer and deteriorating democracy with flourishing insurgent groups. With this view Washington adopted “Plan Colombia” as a part of support policy. Plan Colombia was initially determined as assistance with the objective to facilitate the democratic institutionalization. In 1999 the sum of the support reached 839 millions $ with strong military component. In the subsequent years this support was counted 500 million for a year. The Plan Colombia generated several reactions which gradually resulted in critics of the military orientation and lack of projects in key sectors of the Colombian society. The protests concerned the counter cultivation strategy which included the aerial spraying of illegal crops, resulting in the negative consequences for people’s health and food crops. As an overall assessment of the achievements the Plan Colombia is frequently called complete failure considering its announced goals of conflict resolution and assistance to sustainable development. On the contrary due to undermined confidence of the FARC (which during the negotiation process with the Pastrana’s government managed to rearm and reinforce itself) in the peace intentions of the government provoked the new phase of armed confrontation.\textsuperscript{15}

Politically European Union in its turn in early 2000s separated from the Plan Colombia and took the course to find its own mechanisms of facilitation to the peace process. As it was claimed the activities in this regard were supposed to address civil society, promote human rights issues and protect of biodiversity and environment.\textsuperscript{16}

The victory of Álvaro Uribe in the presidential elections in 2002 brought about several changes in the political component of the conflict discourse. The principal objective of the foreign policy of the new president was to associate the internal armed conflict with the global war on terror initiated by George W. Bush. Thus several armed groups (FARC, ELN and AUC) were recognized as terrorist organizations by the US State Department. This

\textsuperscript{15} Ibid, 7.
\textsuperscript{16} (Pardo 2004, 8)
attachment of the Colombian government to the US policy demonstrates the conviction that US military support is indispensable element of its own counterterrorism struggle.

The increase of military capacities in early 2000s ignored the condition of long lasting armed conflict heavily affecting civil population can result in the escalation of violence and subsequent aggravation of humanitarian situation. First of all it was reflected in the increased rate of displaced persons. According the estimations of Comisión Colombiana de Juristas 360,000 persons (mostly women and children) were forced to be displaced in 2001 .

Chapter 2 - Threats and Vulnerabilities

2.1 Critical Security Approach

The critical security studies emerged with the end of Cold War made a great contribution into the widening-deepening debate in the security studies. New approaches have expanded the whole concept of security, which went far further the simple coverage of traditional military aspects and included other issues. First of all the securitization theory proposed by Copenhagen School challenged the exceptional positions of state to make a claim to have its threats located in the security category and put forward the idea that other entities should be able to make such claim as well.

Ken Booth proposes that politics of the meaning of security begin in the condition of insecurity which involves fear and dangers arising from one or more types of threat. Threats in their turn can vary from direct ones such as armed violence to indirect in structural or culture meanings. More insecurity these threats produce more ‘life-determining’ they will be. 18

Here in order to understand the complexity of the diversity of threats it is also worth to mention the three types of violence (direct, structural and cultural) developed by Johan Galtung. The direct violence (physical and/or verbal) is visible in the way of conduct. However the actions perpetrated by humans do not occur by themselves, they have roots. Here appear two of them: culture of violence (patriarchal, heroic, patriotic, etc) and structure which can be violent by being repressive or exploitative, too stern or too sluggish to provide wellbeing. Cultural violence represents the sum of all various myths of glory and trauma that subsequently are used to justify the direct violence. Structural violence is the sum of all the collisions present in the social structures on all levels solidified in such way that the final

unjust and unequal results are almost immovable. Direct violence in its turn emerges from either some elements or from the total sum of the cultural and structural violence.

Tim Dunne and Nicholas J. Wheeler also suggest that if security is understood as protection from harm, then any violation of fundamental rights implies the presence of insecurity. Security is absent if an individual is restricted to satisfy his subsistence needs, such as food, housing and closing.

Overall critical security studies therefore characterize security as the absence of threats which are not defined solely from the state-centric point of view. Thus security and community appear as closely related concepts attaching importance to such concepts as autonomy, self-determination, self-realization and freedom of the collectivities. The dynamics capable to diminish the capacity of the discursive community responses to them undermine the collective ability of the community to autonomously and freely address such threats.

When society has to face with violence often there appear silences relating to numerous types of threats (for example gender, class, race). Cynthia Enloe defines ‘silent’ as those residing on the margins, lacking language and articulateness or whose voices cannot be heard. Silent on the margins apparently find themselves on the bottom of the political pyramid, lacking public power and being the object of other people’s power. The silence consists in the lack of any significant impact on the trend of events determining the destiny of that group.

Ken Booth argues that silences are political, that is they do not happen naturally, they are made to happen: “the silent in world politics are not simply physically voiceless: they are

politically silenced. The disenfranchised are not born without power: they are disempowered. In world politics, security (and insecurity) is made by political theories – what they say and also what they ignore and silence.”

This political silencing has a record of literal physical extermination of entire groups. Historically indigenous people have been silenced in a brutal manner for quite a long time starting from early colonization era. This group appears as particularly vulnerable group regarding the exposure to multiple existential threats posed by various dynamics in contemporary world. Incorporation in the nation states and cultural domination of the majorities represent the greatest threat to survival of many native communities all over the world. Due to the specificity of indigenous people as a concept they find themselves in more vulnerable situation than other minority groups. In order to elaborate the method to address the insecurity of the native communities these insecurities should be marked out first. This leads to the conceptual meaning of the indigenous people.

David Maybury-Lewis conceptually determines indigenous people according to several features: first as the population that was the first on the certain territory and is still there hence have the “rights of prior occupancy to their lands”; the second is the subordination or incorporation in alien states which consider them as inferiors; they speak their own languages and practice their own culture different from the mainstream population; consciousness of having different identities.

During 1950-60s liberalists and Marxists elaborated the approaches indigenous peoples and national development considering it as a problem for Latin American development explicitly as only economic matter and predicted the probable vanishing of indigenous culture as such. Liberalism assumed that ancestral communities represented the problem of poverty and underdevelopment, which should be approached by means of

---

23 (Booth, Theory…, 160)
24 (Maybury-Lewis, 7-8)
modernization, education, technological progress and cultural adjustment. Marxists in their turn considered Indians as oppressed lower class that should collaborate with other poor. Indigenous groups for their part negated both approaches and headed to strengthening the group identity based on the ethnic and cultural features distinguishing them from the majorities.\textsuperscript{25}

The specificity of indigenous people as a concept is based on the completely different world views, values, vision of nature as sanctity and its relation with humans. Thereafter there emerge several particular issues connecting nature and identity which indicate the extremely vulnerable position of the ancestral communities in the framework of the contemporary nation-state regarding social, political, economical and cultural relations. As argues Duane Champagne: “…the cosmic tie of native community and institutions to cosmic beings and powers puts native understandings of community and institutions at a different order than those provided by contemporary nation states.”\textsuperscript{26} This consideration that indigenous people have different (or unequal) rights within their lands reflects importance of political and psychological qualities of the association with the community.

Taking into consideration the extremely small size of some communities their predicament is extremely grave if they happen to find themselves under the cross fire of the armed conflict. The structural approach proposes the special position of vulnerable groups in the conflict. It appears that their insecurities, vulnerabilities and subsequent victimization hardly can be considered as simple side effects of the armed violence rather than an essential systemic element. Indigenous peoples as a category (with its inherent specificity, explained below) can be located in the center of the conflict structure with complex interactions between multiple actors on the both levels with their interests, intentions, ambitions and activities.


2.2 Indigenous Peoples in Colombia

As argues Kent Eaton in the Colombian case due to mixed population and impossibility to identify clear ethnic differences between guerillas and police or military forces the ethnicity issue does not shape the cleavage of the conflict. However, in contrast to the colonizing migrants there is long-standing indigenous community perceiving themselves separately from the dominant population.

Overall Organización Nacional Indígena de Colombia (ONIC) counts 102 indigenous peoples in the country, however only 87 are recognized by government as such. They comprise 1.7% of overall population of Colombia. 92% of them live in the rural areas. The state officially recognizes their right on 31,066,430 hectares which comprise about 30% of the overall national territory. Legally these lands are organized in the system of resguardos and reservas (in total 710) and incorporate 85,818 families. Indians are the majority in the selva regions of Amazonia and Orinoquía, formally belonging to the departments of Amazonas, Putumayo, Caquetá, Guaviare, Guainía, Vaupés y Vichada, and in mountain zones of Cauca, Nariño, Magdalena and Guajira. In other regions there are also minor groups with a strong cultural identity. The difference in the number of population varies drastically, there are also communities are critically close to the extinction like Taiwano and Kawiyarí.

From the municipal point the national government recognizes the local indigenous cabildos (councils) which carry out the administrative functions. These cabildos are vested to establish special Indian jurisdiction which coexists along with national ordinary one.

Although the National Constitution and international documents (Convention 169 of ILO ratified by Colombia in 1989) which oblige states to guarantee and protect collective rights of the indigenous population, the latest constantly face grave human rights violations.

27 (Eaton 2004, 539)
28 (Legarreta 1998, 421-422).
The grave violations of human rights of the communities, occurring as a consequence of dynamics in the armed conflict per se and direct action of various armed groups, connected to the regional and local political and military power structures or strong economic interests related to drug trafficking and natural resource exploitation, position Indians in extremely vulnerable conditions. These vulnerabilities conditionally can be divided on three interrelated types corresponding to physical (or direct), structural, and cultural insecurities. The first one is associated with the armed conflict and expressed by assassinations, disappearances of traditional leaders, forced displacement, sexual violence, military presence and armed hostilities on the indigenous territories, abandonment of antipersonnel mines and other explosives on the indigenous territories which in addition hindering traditional ways of procuring food result in malnutrition and respective health problems. Structural vulnerabilities are presented by loss of autonomy, imposition of extraneous norms and authority, and abatement of economic base. The cultural component (restricted access to the sacred places or possibility of celebration of the traditional rituals, language, values, and development of economic dependence appears more complex phenomenon jeopardizing to the existence of indigenous identity in a long-term prospective. Here also appears another affixion of the armed conflict and cultural debility represented through poor education facilities evoked partially through permanent hostilities on (or close to) communal territories and forced recruitment by armed groups hampering the educative process of the children. Poor education leads to the lack of the emancipation and continuous silencing of the group in the political process.

As an outcome these numerous detriments occasionally lead to the disorders in social, economic, political, territorial and cultural structures of these communities. The predicament

characterized by various vulnerabilities generates new ethnic conflicts with other non-indigenous groups also victimized by the armed confrontation.

In regard to the cause of the violence it is necessary to acknowledge that it is not the problem of racial persecution but the condition of collective ownership makes them most vulnerable group especially when the protection point on the individual rather than collective responses. With the consideration of the geographic conditions, number of the community members, internal cohesion and ascendancy of traditional authority armed actors manage to control entire communities. With this purpose traditional leaders attract special attention because their elimination facilitates the domination over entire community. Also due to comparatively small population the physical extermination serves as simple method of achievement of desirable result. For the community of 5000 members, assassination of 92 and forced displacement of 1732 members can be regarded to ethnocide. The case with Kankuamo village is extraordinary appalling due to enormous amount of displaced persons (around 300 families), homicide, and impossibility of free movement.\(^{30}\)

This predicament afflicting indigenous people is exacerbated by the geographic location near the national frontiers or remote areas where internal regulations are not complied properly and activities of insurgents and drug traffickers are hard to control. That leads to the situation when various armed actors pretend to employ other forms of control contradicting with Indian traditions and principles by means of terror, threat, and armed violence.

\(^{30}\) Valencia, León, *Parapolítica. La ruta de la expansión paramilitar y los acuerdos políticos* (Bogotá: Intermedio, 2007), 444.
2.3 Land and Environment

The environmental issue in the context of the conflict of Colombia has two important implications. The first refers to the aggravation of tensions between the actors in conflict. This effect is common for the most of the armed conflicts all over the world. It can be the principal cause of armed violence as well as the consequence, which in its turn provokes the further violence as method of competition for means of survival. The second implication brings in the indigenous specificity. Environment as a category has particular significance for the way of life, identity and existence as such of indigenous people. Therefore an ecological degradation (particularly striking the Amazon region) poses a direct existential threat to the indigenous communities. Thus deforestation for the planting, contamination from the usage of agrochemicals, fumigations, deforestation caused by displacement of the cultivation comprise part of the vicious circle of the environmental degradation.\(^{31}\) The majority of the regions (Amazonia, Orinoquia, iner- Andian valleys, humid tropical selva) cultivating illicit substances and thereafter exposed to the aerial fumigations happen to be most important part of the rich ecosystem.

Land and environment issues due to the reach natural resources are intertwined in a way that indigenous people face with expropriation of the ancestral lands, resource exploitation and subsequent degradation. Land property for the indigenous people in Colombia is collective and unalienable. Land has particular cultural and spiritual importance first of all as historical legacy (inherited from ancestors and community). The state in strive to protect the interests of the multinationals encroach into the resguardos, increase the use of force and expose Indian communities to confrontation with guerilla groups.

Amazon region due to both relatively high percentage of the indigenous population and rich ecosystem is particularly demonstrative in sense of connection between

dispossession, environmental degradation and vulnerable state of the ancestral communities. The problem of insecurity of indigenous people of Amazon is common also in other countries of Amazonian region (Brazil, Colombia, Venezuela, Ecuador, Peru, Bolivia, French Guyana, Surinam and Guyana). The Colombian part encompasses some 47 million hectares the majority of which is covered with tropical moist forest. Since most of these countries find themselves in the economically developing conditions the most general threat to the indigenous people arise from the profit hunting sentiments. That is to say the expansion of consumer-oriented model of development in the region is capable to distort the traditional way of life in extremely short period of time, simply by undermining the authority of communal leaders which play essential role in supervise of the activity the community activity in the forest ecosystem. The experience of contact with outsiders during the past three centuries often led to disastrous consequences for locals: extermination, slavery, torture, forced Christianization and exposure to European diseases.

The existential threat to the indigenous population appeared with the contact with Europeans resulting. As a result of these contacts over the past 4 centuries at least 87 different ethnic groups have vanished from the Brazilian Amazon, and the extinction of Indigenous tribes has accelerated due to the deforestation during the XX century. Only a few tribes managed to escape from the contact with colonizers escaping up the rivers into remote territories. Theoretically the Colombian government prohibits anyone to enter territories designated as belonging to indigenous communities. But in practice some communities due to a long interaction with missionaries and dealers have become dependent on them and unwilling to be left alone. The level of this dependency is oscillating relating to the remoteness from commercial centres.

---

32 (Bynyard 1989, 44)
The experience of relations with outsiders has overcome several stages characterized by several changes in demands. Thus first stage resorted to the trade along the river and exploitation of quinine rubber resulting in disastrous ecological and humanitarian consequences. In the 1850s Brazil initiated the process of the engagement of indigenous communities into national economy and their Christianization. Industrial revolution led to mass exploitation of rubber from the tree Hevea. The rubber industry brought slavery into region and massive extermination of the Indian population. By beginning of XX century the export of rubber produced by Casa Arana exceeded thousands of tones. According to different data Casa Arana in order to maintain high growth rates killed from 30,000 to 40,000 Indians within a decade harshly suppressing any sort of resentment.33

The next historical period with negative repercussions for the survival situation of the Amazonian indigenous communities dates to 1950s and 1960s and is known as Era of Violence. La Violencia resulted in expulsion of thousands of peasants from their traditional territory in Andean Cordillera and subsequent colonization which deforested 6 million hectares in Amazonas. This process could not help not having grave environmental consequences such as soil erosion, landslides and drying up of the rivers. The destabilizing of river basins negatively affected on economic life of the region due to reduction of efficiency of hydroelectricity dams and river navigability. Although colonization was not imposed from above (on the contrary migrants often expressed their support to left-wing insurgents) the government had to provide assistance to the colonizers to arrange their enterprises when the colonization became the fait accompli. Apparently this process could not get alone without the involvement of the World Bank. Its loans for two development projects in 1971 and 1976 originally aimed for the construction of infrastructure and communal facilities were distributed for the agrarian needs and led to disastrous environmental consequences.34

33 (Bynuyard 1989, 23)
34 (Bunyaard 1989, 35)
During 60s and 70s the relations between indigenous people and outside world were driven by exploitation of animal skins which was followed by the coca boom in the 1980s. Also in 1985 there was discovered gold in the province of Guiana. Today large Amazon territories are seen by many as potential space for further colonisation and extractive industries of timber, forest products and mineral resources. Technically the system of resguardos grants the territorial rights only to sub soil, leaving mineral resources to the state. Minerals attract also guerillas that compel gold miners to pay protection money and follow certain standard of behavior.

Therefore for indigenous people the conflict (as clash of interests for territory) and respective victimization had started significantly earlier than for the rest of Colombian society. Through time and transformation of the conflict the situation has been deteriorating due to the growing number of the involved actors.

Here it is also necessary to mention the reproduction of the local conflict related to the land issue in its turn caused by previous violence and displacement. Among multiple aspects of indigenous vulnerabilities the essential issue of the land claims was put in the process called “Campaña de Liberación de la Madre Tierra” in 2005. The situation in the department of Cauca demonstrates social and political land conflict on the local and regional levels among various communities of peasants, Afro-Colombians and some urban habitants. These tensions are expressed through negation of indigenous issues, distribution of public announcements of authorities, threatening to life of indigenous leaders, establishment of social organizations such as Fedecampo, resisting to indigenous movements. Moreover these tensions are complemented with threats, assassinations and armed actions affecting all of the communities and executed by guerillas, paramilitaries and state military.35

Political actions of Indigenous people organized by Consejo Regional Indígena de Cauca (CRIC) and Asociación de Cabildos Indígenas del Oriente del Cauca (ACIN) revolving around the land claims also bring the social and political matters – territory arrangement, ethno-education, culture and survival of communities (the process of indigenous mobilization will be discussed in details in Chapter 3). Consequent conflicts between peasant and indigenous communities arise from the several problem proceedings. The expansion of indigenous resguardos generates the resentment of the peasant communities claiming that the first “occupy the best lands” and don’t use them rationally leaving uncultivated. Indigenous movements seek legal access to the ancestral land by means of various mechanisms. One is the legal procedure of incorporation of new territories. Another is simple acquisition of the land property with own economic resources gained from international cooperation or from public movements.

The process of expansion of resguardos and indigenous emancipation presuppose implementation of social projects in education and healthcare which in their turn have negative repercussions for other peasant and Afro-Colombian communities. Education in the case of indigenous communities is fundamental since it is strategically important part of the construction of the movement, notion of autonomy, culture, struggle for territory and unity. From the other hand the privatization of the education system on the certain territories (resguardos and cabildos) affects first of all directly peasants’ social wellbeing. Education projects also overstepping the borders officially recognized resguardos addressing outside indigenous communities are often perceived by peasant and Afro-Colombian communities as part of struggle for territory. Therefore the education problem is referred to the territory.

37 Ibid, 58.
38 Ibid, 78.


### 2.4 Globalization and conflict

Dynamic globalization process in Latin America took a dramatic turn after the introduction of development principles of Washington consensus during 1990s. Economic restructuring towards greater market openness and better integration into the global economy had controversial outcomes for the entire society of these countries particularly affecting the well-being of the vulnerable groups, such as indigenous peoples. The neoliberal politics in order to increase the country’s competitiveness decrease social spending hitting an education and healthcare.

José Aristabal García analyzing the impact of the globalization on the war in Colombia concludes that overall the relation between multinational companies and the conflict appears to be at least threefold. First, it is expressed in way of their attitude and policy towards the state; second refers to the contributing directly and indirectly to the intensification of the repression of the some sectors of the population; third one is associated with the direct relation between some of them and actors of the conflict.\(^{39}\)

The relations between multinationals and the state are shaped by several particular intertwined features characterized by great weight of the private sector that sometimes acts as public authority; state debility in facing with external investment; intrusion of private interests to public sector.\(^{40}\)

In early 90s Colombia initiated a process of a trade liberalization which introduced drastic tariffs cuts. In addition to this measures there were carried out several structural reformations in the labor and financial spheres. Indirectly these changes influenced the internal armed conflict by enhancing the presence of the multinationals in the extracting industries. The amplified number of the interested actors intensified and complicated the

---

\(^{39}\) (Aristizábal García 2007, 154)

\(^{40}\) Ibid, 155.
armed conflict drastically. In this regard petroleum and agro industries play a particularly significant role through direct and indirect activities.

Petroleum sector assumes essential part of the Colombian economy calculated as more the quarter of total export value (http://www.dane.gov.co/files/investigaciones/boletines/exportaciones/anexos_export_mar10.xls). However the absence of the national exploitation strategy impedes the development process converting the natural resource in a crucial factor of the conflict especially in areas of Arauca and Casanare.

In 1964 Texaco begins the explorations in the municipalities of La Hormiga, Valle del Guamez and San Miguel. In 2004 the Uribe administration with the creation of Agencia Nacional de Hidrocarburos has stimulated the drastic increase in the industry. This agency taking part of the functions of the state oil company Ecopetrol (in particular contracting) has respectively decreased the role of the latest offering favorable economic advantages to the foreign companies.

In the conditions of the of the armed political violence foreign companies with the purpose to avoid negative effects opted out the easiest way to insure the security either paying to state ('impuesto de guerra') or armed groups. Paramilitaries have become the principal allies of major investors and multinationals providing this security in more efficient manner (even though with frequent grave human rights violations).

Guerilla groups in their turn facing the lack of funding with the end of the Cold War rapidly figured out that petroleum could become a lucrative source of finance. That was the case with ELN which began to persecute the foreign companies starting with German Mannesmann AC in Sarare de Arauca by means of attacks on facilities, kidnappings and assassinations of the personnel. As a result the gained incomes allowed ELN to carry out its
rearmament. The example was followed by AUC in 90s extorting through offering the protection of the businesses. Thus in general terms the oil extracting sector has gradually converted into the military bank and principal source of the war finance maintaining the conflict in indirect way.

Along with indirect manner there also exists direct way in which transnational extracting (petroleum) companies get involved in the armed violence and pose an existential threat to indigenous communities in physically and culturally (to identity). In this regard the establishment of a dangerous alliance between multinationals and paramilitaries emerges as a determinative link (difficult to prove but frequently reported by numerous testimonies). Interesting, that if mark out in the same map areas of major interests of multinational investments and areas where there were registered massacres, repressions and displacements there appears a great geographical coincidence of both areas. In these areas the interests of corporations collide with those of the small or medium landowners or owners of ancestral lands perpetuated by the national Constitution as collective property pertained by indigenous and afro-descendent communities. The paramilitary groups are those who commit atrocious activity contra communities forcing them to displace from their territories, which later occasionally are subjected to the mineral exploitations.

Case of Wayuu

Bahía de Portete on the north of Guajira is an ancestral territory of Wayuu. In April of 2004 the paramilitary group Jorge 40 visited the village maltreating and abusing women, torturing, killing and abducting children and assassinating 12 persons. As a consequence there were displaced several hundreds of community members (UNHCR registered more than 300). The motive of this appalling massacre could not be related with inter insurgent fight because Wayuu had never permitted the guerilla presence on their territory. The case

---

allegedly can be related with discovering of the enormous deposits of petroleum and gas the exploitation of which had been contracted by Chevron Texaco.\footnote{Aristizábal García 2007, 159}

The case of Cofan.

The ancestral territory of the Cofan people is situated in the selva zone between Ecuador and Colombia. Around thousand Cofan members live in eleven communities on the Colombian department of Putumayo. Ultimately its territory, culture and survival are under serious threat posed by the drug trafficking, armed conflict and large megaprojects.

From 1999 numerous Cofan members were displaced from their resguardos owing to the frequent intrusions into indigenous territories, assassinations, disappearances, forced recruiting, sexual abuses, destructions of the civil facilities, and areal fumigations. The displacement was caused not only by armed actions of various fractions in confrontation for territory but also by a land expropriation strategy.

The arrival of AUC into Putumayo was allegedly conditioned by the purpose to facilitate the resource exploitation by transnational companies. October 18, 2005 the community of San Marcelino experienced various abuses by paramilitaries who abducted the cabildo, detained 6 Indians and forced eleven families to displace. Several weeks later came the state forces to control the zone and in December Operaciones Petroleras Andinas (OPA) initiated the exploitation.

The majority of the Cofan resguardos is situated close to the oil exploitation fields. Thus the block Alea of 569,000 hectares, contracted by Repsol y Chaco in December, 2004 crosses the ancestral territory. Moreover the impact of the political violence on the Cofan community has reached the point where the survival of entire groups is under the question. In May 2007 several resguardos and communities of Cofan announced that they were exposed to the indiscriminate bombings of state forces killing one person and arbitrary detaining 30 other
persons. As a result 40 families had to displace from their houses owing to fear of further repressions (Actualidad Étnica, 31 de Mayo de 2007, http://www.etniasdecolombia.org/actualidadetnica/detalle.asp?cid=5430). Due to the extremely sparse number of the Cofan population the every single killing, disappearance or displacement has a crucial impact on the entire community.

Overall oil exploitation has dramatically impacted the indigenous communities resulting in political and social disorganization due to the financial flows generating division and polarization; enhancement of colonization and territory invasion with consequent displacement; militarization due to the extended paramilitary presence; environmental degradation and contamination; conflict intensification related to the interests of the armed groups in the petroleum infrastructure; and in addition cultural and spiritual damages.
Chapter 3 - Security and Emancipation

“...lo que buscamos nosotros es solidificar las comunidades para que sean comunidades
autónomas y fuertes y logren ejercer poder sobre sus territorios.”

Andrés Camilo Artunduaga Abril

3.1 Responsibility to Protect vs. Emancipation

As argues Ken Booth when victims are silenced (because the expression of his
insecurity may lead to a greater insecurity) someone has to speak for them.⁴³ People finding
themselves in the armed conflict are most likely to suffer more than people in relatively
peaceful environment. In the context of the victimization of the particular group (especially
considering urgent situation with survival of many indigenous communities in Colombia)
there emerge questions of the ‘responsibility to protect’. The classical perception of its
principle and definition as something belonging explicitly to the state sovereignty and
domestic jurisdiction is changing. This dynamic became particularly evident on the 2005
World Summit when there was expressed endorsement for ‘responsibility to protect’
transforming the sovereignty from absolute to contingent. Thereafter the international
community assumes the responsibility automatically neglecting the ‘Westphalian sovereignty’
if the state is not capable to protect its citizens from mass killings or ethnic cleansings.⁴⁴ The
scope of protection thus resorted to such crimes as genocide, war crimes, ethnic cleansing and
crimes against humanity which overlooks many important non-military humanitarian issues
related to rights to food, health, education, etc.⁴⁵ Moreover the case with indigenous
communities does not fully add up to this statement due to the presence of other sorts of

⁴³ (Booth, Theory..., 2007, 168).
⁴⁴ Alex J. Bellamy, “The Responsibility to Protect” in Security Studies: An Introduction, ed Paul D. Williams
(New York: Routledge, 2008), 423.
⁴⁵ Daniel Warner and Gilles Giacca, “Responsibility to Protect” in Post-Conflict Peacebuilding: A Lexicon, ed
elements (as special type of identity and its dependence on ambient conditions) threatening to which (that is not only by means of ethnocide or mass killing) jeopardizes their existence as a group. In the conditions of the protracted armed conflict appears the overlap of various types of interrelated threats to native communities represented from on hand by physical violence and from another by cultural deterioration or loss of group identity. In this sense community displacement or ecological consequences of armed actions may gravely affect the group, even if not a single member was killed. Hence there emerge the questions of when and where international intervention should be applied, in what manner or should it be applied at all.

The conflicts unleashed over religion, ethnicity, resources or territorial claims throughout its evolution are capable to generate new grievances due to the real or perceived violation of human rights perpetrated by participating parties. These violations obviously exaggerate the social divisions facilitating the people’s mobilization which can consequently lead to the violent action. Such mobilizations tend to demonize their opponents which facilitate and even justify the further killing and commission of further human rights violations.

Armed hostilities are most likely to aggravate extreme poverty and generate condition negatively affecting large numbers of people who are vulnerable and lack necessary mechanism coping with this sort of predicament. Hence the matters of reconstructing of infrastructure of basic services and capacity-building are crucial for the sustainable peace process. In this regard the essential role is played by international community which by means of humanitarian assistance, investments and stimulation of the development helps affected community to carry out reconstruction and economical recovery. Thus support of various development projects address the matters of economic and social disparity and consequently diminishes the people’s vulnerability and improves overall security.
In more general terms considering the post-conflict peace building process Vincent Chetail notes that while the intervention of international community might be vitally needed there should be recognized the essential role of local actors, in particular civil society, which are better equipped to bring about a sustainable peace and respectively provide security.

Volker Türk considering the strategy of the peace building process concludes that it should have the bottom up trajectory starting from the local communal level. Essential role pertains to the local authorities and people themselves whose support is inalienable part of the process. Thus capacity-building activities should be oriented on the empowerment of these local actors, who consequently become self-reliant. Nevertheless the process of capacity building also requires the coherent, reasonable and sustained activities from the side of international community.

John Paul Lederach considering the wider context of peace-building argues that although the process might be perceived as initiative developed by the external resources, the real situation is other way round. The greatest resource for sustaining peace lies in the local population and its culture. This statement would make a conceptual difference that international community should not conceive local population as receptor rather as resource.

Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) appear as one of the most demonstrative representatives of the local actors bringing the discourse of human rights issues, developing creative strategies of peace-building and mobilizing communities. In the context of security of silenced and vulnerable groups who tend to be particularly affected by conflict CSOs assume the function of their representation. CSOs also contribute both relieving post-conflict situation and preventing the emergence of new violent conflicts. Thus addressing the underlying causes for conflict or in other words confronting the multiple threats through social development

(such as education, job creation, good governance, civil participation) CSOs basically implement the emancipation projects on the local level.

Brining civil society into the context of peace building reveals an essential connectivity between civil society, security and emancipation both in theoretical and political (practical) discourses. As Ken Booth (the most eminent concept advocate) notes, emancipatory politics foremost should address the question of creation of “conditions in which sentient bodies are never driven into sites of insecurity where the freedom to ask ‘Why?’ and to live in dignity is never present”.\(^{48}\) He conceptualizes emancipation as:

“as a discourse of politics, emancipation seeks the securing of people from those oppressions that stop them carrying out what they would freely choose to do, compatible with the freedom of others. It provides a three-fold framework for politics: a philosophical anchorage for knowledge, a theory of progress for society, and a practice of resistance against oppression. Emancipation is the philosophy, theory, and politics of inventing humanity”.\(^{49}\)

In regard to relationship between security and emancipation in general terms Booth considers that security would extend when emancipation eradicates the structural oppressions. That is to practice security is to create the emancipatory space without oppression. He proposes emancipation as a complex process going far beyond the obtaining the liberty, which is nothing more than propaganda without economic status.\(^{50}\) Therefore emancipation is a response to both war and non-armed violence. Thus promotion of the human rights and even distribution of resources contributes into building of sustainable order and justice.\(^{51}\)

Joseph Ruane and Jennifer Todd argue that emancipator approach aims on the resolution of the conflict rather than simple its management. The concept is perceived differently from the one where oppressed groups are liberated from the oppressions. Emancipation for them is a “process by which participants in a system which determines, distorts and limits their potentialities, come together actively to transform it and in the process

\(^{48}\) (Booth, *Theory..., 104*)
\(^{49}\) Ibid, 112.
\(^{51}\) Ibid, 323.
transform themselves”. Therefore emancipation in this sense refers to the combined action of governments, communities, political parties, and individuals. The process presupposes the mitigation of the intensity of communal identification which is facilitated by greater individualization, characterized by the accent on the exploration and expression of the needs and wishes by individuals and subgroups (even if it contradicts the interests of wider communal identities).

Claudia Aradau notes that emancipation “radically tackles the concept of democratic politics and the issue of institutional authority in claiming a voice for the silenced”. Aradau argues that in order to make the process properly there is needed ‘dis-identification’ or deconstruction of the assigned identity and assumption of the universal principle, making women, for example, equal citizens, and migrants – to workers with equal rights.

Emancipation can be considered as process liberating people from physical, social, economic, political and other constraints and enabling them to make choices they want to make. Therefore emancipation has become an essential security mechanism for the silenced groups (women, colonies, workers, peoples of African descent during the XX century) in sense of providing necessary instruments to confront multiple threats. Thus emancipation as the security discourse category concentrate attention on people, justice and change.

### 3.2 Experience of Indigenous self-development

Initially the Indian mobilization started in late 19th century in Cauca due to the liberalization and deprivation from ancestral lands. In 1904 Caucan elites with the purpose of

---

53 (Ruane 2005, 253)
55 Ibid, 402.
economic expansion imposed restrictive measures upon indigenous communities of the department (such as installing fences, prohibition of growing plants in the mountains, modernization of haciendas with effect on labor force).\(^{56}\) As the counteraction there was organized a movement called La Quintinada led by Quintin Lame.

During 1960s peasants started to organize themselves establishing Asociación Nacional de Usuarios Campesinos (ANUC) which became an important social movement. For indigenous people lacking this sort of organization, ANUC became a starting point for more advanced further actions and structures. This organization gave impetus to the activity to claim the land and oppose the power of armed landowners. However, when ANUC negated the particular Indian mobilization that stressed upon the struggle for culture and autonomy in the movement agenda, the latest began organize themselves in small groups striving for representation of the community interests.

In 1963 some Guambiano and Nasa leaders organized the Sindicato del Oriente Caucano with the purpose of claiming their rights on land and autonomy. However neither Sindicato nor ANUC managed to represent the interests of ancestral communities. This failure led to the creation of Consejo Regional del Cauca (CRIC) and the Consejo Regional Indigena del Tolima (CRIT) by young indigenous intellectuals in 1971. The key difference with previous organizations was that CRIC stressed upon the point that although indigenous struggles are part of the peasant struggles due to some similarities in dispossession, the first ones have their own specificity. CRIC was created with a purpose of claiming rights, reinstatement and expansion of the resguardos, restoration of history, language and traditions, organization of self-defense forces.

Due to the protest orientation of the Indian mobilization threatening to elite privileges they became the object of repeated attacks perpetrated by police and paramilitary groups. The

indigenous communities were compelled to seek alliance with guerillas but ideological differences led to the break up between CRIC and guerilla groups like FARC, ELN and M-19.\(^57\)

The emancipation process developed locally through the work of several organizations (Organización Indígena de Antioquia OIA, CRIC, Organización Regional del Valle del Cauca OREWA) finally reached the national level only in 1982 with the creation of the National Organization of Indigenous Peoples ONIC.

As it was the case with contra guerilla militarizing of the landowners and drug traffickers indigenous mobilizing and emancipation coincided with the period during the 1980-90s which can be characterized by political liberalization. This period can be characterized by the introduction of democratic reforms aimed on corruption minimization, and promotion of rights discourses. The essential aspect of these reforms concerned the issues of diversity in population. This process was quite common for the majority of the Latin American countries which redefined the legal statues of diverse groups. These provisions were essential for indigenous peoples who had always been the most powerless and disadvantaged group suffering from various forms of institutionalized discrimination.

The struggle of ethnic movements for their territories and natural resources has been developing counter several challenges: most crude forms of extraction (like deforestation or excavate mining); infrastructure construction (like building roads, hydroelectric facilities or ports) which threatens community’s traditional way of life; capitalist forms of agro-industrial exploitation, which jeopardize the ecological viability and hamper the access to the cultivation of the land.\(^58\)

\(^57\) (Vanegas 2009, 27)

Basically the expression of their vulnerability in the national context can be considered at least twofold referring to physical attacks by various armed actors and structural predicament reflected in lack of representation and rights consultations. The transparent example of the second type of vulnerability is the launching of government projects on the ancestral lands without any consulting with local population. Thereafter respectively to these vulnerabilities the strategy of indigenous mobilization in Colombia combined armed struggle along with legislative fights that finally resulted in the respective constitutional provisions in 1991. The ONIC put forward several objectives of its activity referring to the defense of autonomy, territory, culture and language, recovery of lands, protection of resguardos, control of natural resources, implementation of development and economic projects, recovery of traditional medicine. Overall law became an important instrument of indigenous resistance, however with its limitation. It managed to frame political claims which allowed indigenous peoples to make claims in front of the state.

Important issue of the indigenous emancipation discourse brought in by ONIC refers to the self determination and new concept of multicultural nation capable to provide equal rights to the multiple minority groups. The question of indigenous identity appears quite urgent due to the imposition of cultural models and subsequent community displacement. The strategy of separation culture from land as tool of gaining control over the territory is often implemented by the extraction industries. Moreover the situation is also aggravated by the state institutions not recognizing the ancestral rights and guerilla groups recruiting the members of indigenous communities.

The shift of the accent in the discourse from ‘rights of minorities’ to ‘rights of peoples’ amplifies the claims for autonomy and self-determination. These claims include the issues of collective land titling, self government, bilingual education and traditional medicine. In the rights context there emerge the specific questions of traditional indigenous organizing
which involve spiritual relation to the land, integral environmentalist perspective and consensual decision making (Jean E. Jackson “Rights to Indigenous Culture p 206”). These visions in some sense undermine the notion of nation-state sovereignty, its monopoly on violence and respective matters of citizenship and legal system.

With the intensification of the confrontation in 1980s 1990s there appeared new priorities of the civil peace movement. Many entire communities facing an existential threat experienced the resistance of the civil society. Thus in some zones of the country there were organized “communities of peace” (comunidades de paz) which claimed to all of the armed actors their determination of non-collaboration neither permission of presence in their territories. The addressing of these objectives took a form of nonviolent resistance. The peaceful forms of resistance contribute into the sustainable peace process and promote the idea of respect of international humanitarian law by all armed actors of the conflict.

Dario Villamizar argues that indigenous leaders are perceived to represent a threat capable to undermine the authority of the local elites. Therefore resorting to the violence through diverse methods appears to be an expected option. The way to address these issues is organization and consolidation of the social and political structures of indigenous communities. This process has demonstrated that with the practicing the autonomy and carrying out the resistance the Indian groups avoid involvement in the armed conflict, demand respect to their territories and consideration as neutral and peaceful zones. Various individual expressions and collective actions (such as consolidation of Guardia Indígena, Premio NAcional de Paz, La Gran Minga por la vida) had their repercussion in other indigenous communities and inspired them to reaffirm their adherence to peace, coexistence and respect.

The most eminent case of such resistance is the activity of Guardia Indígena organized by CRIC in department of Cauca. The Guardia does not represent policial structure rather a

59 (Jackson 2007, 206).
humanitarian mechanism whose activity mainly resorts to the coordination of liberation actions of abducted persons; negotiations with armed actors over the exclusion of indigenous communities from the conflict; talks with local drug traffickers over the disassembling of the processing labs on the indigenous territories; minimization of the armed confrontation effects on the Indian lands (http://www.cric-colombia.org/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=26&Itemid=41).

In Bajo Putumayo nonviolent resistance of indigenous community of Cofán took the form of the Plan of Life of Cofán which introduced the strategy of pacific survival in the conditions of conflict. The basic idea of this strategy is to clear out the necessities and aspirations of the indigenous communities and find out the ways to tackle them. Thus there are employed norms and directives to approach the social, environmental, economic and political conflicts with consideration of the issues of ecology, human rights and cultural differences. As a result of the project the Cofán village managed to put across their concepts of development through the participative process and obtain external funds.\(^{60}\) The proposal of resguardo amplification is probably the most significant way to facilitate cultural survival and autonomy of the Cofán people. Between 2000 and 2007 there were recognized several resguardos among them Ukumani Kanki is the spiritual center of the group (http://www.ecoportal.net/Contenido/Temas_Especiales/Pueblos_Indigenas/Colombia_coca_petroleo_y_conflicto_en_territorio_cofan).

The Proyecto Nasa initiating in 1980 represents the plan of life of several communities in the Northern part of the department. The principal objective is the formation of new community conscious, organized and educated by means of introduction of pacific counter war resistance strategies and several initiatives addressing environmental, economic,

---

educational, legal, healthcare, youth, female, commercial matters (http://www.redepaz.org.co/Galardonado-el-Proyecto-Nasa).

All these multiple experiences have contributed to the process of the reorientation of the civil society organization. As states Arturo Escobar the future of the rights of the ethnic minorities to control their biological resources will depend on the mobilization of ethnic organizations and other sectors of civil society (like NGO) in the process of planning on international and national levels.  

**3.3 International incursion**

The political dialogue known as London/Cartagena process (2003-2005) shaped the international cooperation strategy which brought together into the peace process multiple actors such as Government, international community, CSOs, Church and business sector. As one of the outcomes UNDP initiated Small Grant Program with the purpose to find CSOs on the local level and facilitate their participation in the political dialogue of the peace process and implementation of peace initiatives. Thus the Program supported several peace initiatives directed on the work with vulnerable groups, construction of alliances, strengthen networks and support social cohesion.  

One of such initiative projects takes place in the southern region of Huila named Consolidación del proceso de asamblea constituyente (Consolidation of the Constitutional Assembly Process). The projects is oriented on providing support to constitutional assembly on the communal level, that represents of itself an organized group exercising its rights to participate in the decision-making process on the local level. The assembly encourages members from all sectors of society (from women and youth to cooperatives and indigenous

---

61 (Escobar 2004, 293)  
peoples) to take part. It develops the people’s civil ability to participate, indicate the key
issues of work and formulate the agenda which in its turn promotes civic resistance to the
armed conflict. 63

Another source of the financial support to the peace building in Colombia comes from
European Union. The specificity of European participation implies the application approach
conceptually different from US Plan Colombia. The financial support is seeks to facilitate the
communities and CSOs to find the way to solve their problems in the conflict ambient
through the Ayuda Oficial al Desarrollo (AOD). In the framework of AOD there was
elaborated the strategy of creation Peace Laboratories (Laboratorios de Paz) that represent
complex of social processes of participation and institutional consolidation on the local and
regional levels. The principal objective is the collective construction of conditions for the
sustainable peace based on the life in dignity of all of the citizens through transformations of
the economic, social, cultural and political order. 64

Thus the foreign support of emancipator process is concentrated on the capacity-
building through facilitation of various social programs. Thus for example the Program de
Atención a Desplazados y Grupos Vulnerables with the purpose of providing support to Life
Plan of Korebaju People located in the departments of Caquetá and Putumayo has launched
the development project called Korebaju Pai Pajachere Kuasame – Garantizando el future del
pueblo Korebaju. The project is directly financed by USAID and has 4 fundamental fields:
promotion of ethno-education, ethnic healthcare, strengthening of autonomy and authority,
sovereignty of food supply and nutrition quality. The implementation of this fields bears very
material and practical character from construction and equipment the classrooms to
organization of medical meetings, legal consultations with traditional leaders and technical

63 Ibid
64 Convenio de Financiación Específica entre la Comunidad Europea y la República de Colombia, Disposiciones
Técnico Administrativas Anexo 2, Convenio Núm. COL/B/-3100/2001/0094
assistance for food crops cultivation. Therefore as explains the coordinator of the project Andrés Camilo Artunduaga Abril, the project creates a manual for coexistence and life plan of the community. By means of ethno-education the community recuperates its culture which is under the threat of extinction. The project is aimed to consolidate the communities, make them strong and autonomous, and enjoy the authority over their own territories.

---

65 Fundación para el Desarrollo Local Comunitario – FUNDACOMUNIDAD, “Programa de Atención a Desplazados y Grupos Vulnerables Módelo de Ficha de Proyecto-IDPs Fase III” (the project presented 9/30/2009)
66 Interview with Andres Camilo Artunduaga Abril, FUNDACION PARA EL DESARROLLO LOCAL COMUNITARIO, coordinator of the of the Project Korebaju, 26/05/2010, Budapest-Florencia.
Conclusion

The case study suggests numerous implications both in theoretical and practical terms. In this sense I think it would be reasonable to distinct the two. In respect to the theory my research was aimed to answer the questions over the emancipation and its application as an alternative or extension of the responsibility to protect and respective repercussions for security issues. Therefore I tried to find a way emancipation can be connected to responsibility to protect; its meaning for silenced groups such as indigenous people; the role of international community in this regard; and whether state’s ability to manage the security matters should be or can be ceded to non-state actors.

Reasoning in the terms of ‘responsibility to protect’ as a way of armed intervention by international community in cases of genocide, mass killings, ethnocide and crimes against humanity considers only the questions of the direct physical violence threatening to existence of a certain group. Critical Security Studies propose the amplified understanding of security extending its matters, objects and subjects far beyond the traditional meaning of state/national military security. Also as the case of indigenous peoples suggests, physical extinction can be executed by various means exceeding the armed violence. In this context the mechanism does not apply. However the ‘responsibility’ as moral and humanitarian norm remains.

The concept of ‘emancipation’ as a process liberating people from physical, social, economic, political and other constraints and enabling them to make choices they want to make appears as an alternative way to provide security for silenced groups. In this sense the concept has a lot in common with the concept of ‘positive peace’ defined as “pattern of cooperation and integration between major human groups”.\(^{67}\) Both concepts are oriented either on elimination or acquirement of the instruments contra structural insecurities and

---

vulnerabilities. Confrontation with threats and construction of peace are achieved through justice and fairness, empowerment and choice, mutual respect of rights, acceptance of common humanity duties, promotion of world-order values, economic justice, nonviolence, humane government, ecological sustainability, human rights.

The role of international community in emancipatory activities appears in indirect manner oriented on enabling and facilitation of local actors to decide how to solve their problems in the conflict environment. Thereafter it is worth to point out on the important dynamic crossing the both levels of the conflict structure (described in the first chapter) bringing together outside actors with those who are in the center of the conflict under the cross fire. This dynamic addressing first of all local level subsequently can have repercussions in the wider national community.

Emancipation is sometimes criticized for being only theoretical category not applicable in practice. Case of Colombia as the response to this statement demonstrates the opposite. Unfortunately due to numerous reasons I could not travel to Colombia to carry out more detailed research on the ground therefore I had to rely upon a lot of secondary sources. However I managed to receive priceless experience and implement part of the work Peace Research Center Gernika Gogoratuz, Spain which enabled me to get access to the most important part of the process – people who work for bringing about the change. The possibility to interview some of the practitioners has cleared out a lot of questions related to the actual actions of CSOs and NGOs on the ground.

As for the case of violence in Colombia I would like to sum up several points related to the essence of the conflict and predicament of the vulnerable groups. First of all I argued that although the conflict is constantly characterized as problem generated by drug issue (and it is important factor, have to admit) its nature is more profound and associated more with competition for territory control. Drugs appear more as a consequence rather than the reason.
From the structural point of view the violence is fostered from the outside (e.g. by land/natural resources aspirations of developing market economies and drug consumption in other countries).

As for the security of indigenous peoples several examples of community mobilizations (like Indigenous Guard or Plan Cofán) has demonstrated the efficiency of the confrontation to conflict in the non-violent manner through emancipatory activities. However, the perspective is not so bright and clear. Although a lot depends on the local actors such as CSOs and traditional authorities international support (in particular financial) as it was already stated, has a crucial impact on the scale and successful implementation of the development projects. Andres Camilo Artunduaga Abril shared that obtain international financial support for such projects day to day becomes more difficult.
Appendices

Appendix 1 - List of Indigenous Organizations in Colombia

1. AsoU´wa
2. Asociación de Cabildos y Autoridades Tradicionales Indígenas de Arauca
3. Cabildo Mayor del Pueblo Muisca
4. Cabildo Mayor de San Andrés de Sotavento Córdoba y Sucre
5. Consejo Regional Indígena del Cauca
6. Consejo regional Indígena del Guainía
7. Consejo Regional Indígena del Guaviare
8. Consejo Regional Indígena de Caldas
9. Consejo Regional Indígena del Tolima
10. Consejo Regional Indígena del Vaupés
11. Consejo Regional Indígena del Vichada
12. Organización Indígena de Antioquia
13. Organización Regional Embera Wounaan
14. Organización Regional Indígena del Valle del Cauca
15. Consejo Regional Indígena de Risaralda
16. Consejo Regional Indígena del Huila
17. Organización Regional Indígena del Quindío
18. Organización Regional Indígena del Casanare Zonales
19. Cabildo Mayor del Trapecio Amazónico
20. Confederación Indígena Tairona
21. Consejo Regional Indígena del Medio Amazonas
22. Confederación Indígena del Alto Amazonas
23. Consejo Regional Indígena del Orteguaza Medio Caquetá
24. La Lucha y Organización Indígena Uho Thuja del Río Orinoco
25. Musu-runacuna (Hombres Nuevos) Putumayo
26. Organización Indígena del Sur de Colombia
27. Organización Uitoto del Caquetá Amazonas y Putumayo
28. Organización Zonal Indígena del Putumayo
29. Unión de Indígenas del Guainía y Vichada
30. Organización Zonal Indígena de la Pedrera Mirití Amazonas
31. Organización Zonal Indígena Wayuu del Sur de la Guajira
32. Organización Zonal Murui Amazonas
33. Consejo Indígena Zonal de Tarapacá Amazonas
34. Unidad Indígena del Pueblo Awa
35. Organizaciones Wiwa, Yugumaiun, Bunkuanarrua Tayrona
36. Cabildos Mayores del Río Sinú y Río Verde
37. Movimiento Cívico Wayuu de la Guajira
38. Cabildo Chimila del Magdalena
39. Cabildo Mayor de Socorpa del Cesar
40. Consejo de Caciques Bari y Asociación Comunidad Motilón Bari de Colombia -Norte de Santander
41. Cabildo Yukpa de la Serranía del Perijá del Cesár

50
Appendix 2 - Map of Indigenous Population in Colombia

Fuente: www.etniasdecolombia.org
Bibliography


Convenio de Financiación Específica entre la Comunidad Europea y la República de Colombia, Disposiciones Técnico Administrativas Anexo 2, Convenio Núm. COL/B/-3100/2001/0094


Fundación para el Desarrollo Local Comunitario – FUNDACOMUNIDAD, “Programa de Atención a Desplazados y Grupos Vulnerables Módelo de Ficha de Proyecto-IDPs Fase III” (the project presented 9/30/2009)


